

# Responsibility of International Organizations

Essays in Memory of Sir Ian Brownlie

*Edited by*

Maurizio Ragazzi

MARTINUS  

---

NIJHOFF  

---

PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON  
2013

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Responsibility of international organizations : essays in memory of Sir Ian Brownlie / edited by Maurizio Ragazzi.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-90-04-25607-1 (hardback : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-90-04-25608-8 (e-book)

1. Tort liability of international agencies. 2. Government liability (International law) I. Brownlie, Ian. II. Ragazzi, Maurizio.

K967.5.R47 2013

341.2—dc23

2013024536

This publication has been typeset in the multilingual "Brill" typeface. With over 5,100 characters covering Latin, IPA, Greek, and Cyrillic, this typeface is especially suitable for use in the humanities. For more information, please see [www.brill.com/brill-typeface](http://www.brill.com/brill-typeface).

ISBN 978-90-04-25607-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-25608-8 (e-book)

Copyright 2013 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Global Oriental, Hotei Publishing, IDC Publishers and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA.

Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

## CONTENTS

Editor's Preface .....	xi
Sir Ian Brownlie—Summary Biography and Select Bibliography .....	xv
Contributors .....	xix
Table of Cases .....	xxv
Table of Documents .....	xxxix
List of Abbreviations .....	xliii

### PART ONE

#### SETTING THE STAGE

##### *International Organizations' Responsibility between Codification and Progressive Development*

1. Some Reflections on Basic Issues Concerning the Responsibility of International Organizations .....	3
Antônio Augusto Cançado Trindade	
2. The Processes of Law-Making: The Law Relating to International Organizations as an Example .....	15
Kenneth Keith	
3. Codification, Progressive Development, or Scholarly Analysis? The Art of Packaging the ILC's Work Product .....	29
Sean D. Murphy	
4. International Organizations Are Definitely Not States. Cursory Remarks on the ILC Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations .....	41
Alain Pellet	

5. 'Weighing' the Articles on Responsibility of International Organizations ..... 55  
Michael Wood

## PART TWO

## ASSESSING THE COMMISSION'S APPROACH

*State Responsibility and Responsibility of International Organizations*

## (i) General Considerations

6. An Assessment of the ILC's Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations ..... 71  
C.F. Amerasinghe
7. International Organizations and State Responsibility ..... 79  
Dan Sarooshi
8. Viability of the ILC's Articles Formulated on the Basis of the Articles on State Responsibility ..... 89  
Chusei Yamada

## (ii) Comparing the Two Sets of Articles

9. Parallel Worlds, Parallel Clauses: Remarks on the Relationship between the Two Sets of ILC Articles on International Responsibility and the UN Charter ..... 97  
Maurizio Arcari
10. An Uneasy Transition? Linkages between the Law of State Responsibility and the Law Governing the Responsibility of International Organizations ..... 109  
Vincent-Joël Proulx
11. Within and Beyond *Mutatis Mutandis* ..... 121  
Tullio Scovazzi

(iii) *Lex Specialis*/Rules of the Organization

12. The Role of *Lex Specialis* in the Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations ..... 135  
Kristen E. Boon

CONTENTS

vii

- |     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 13. | Reflections on the Scope of Application of the Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations ..... | 147 |
|     | Arnold N. Pronto   |     |
| 14. | Practice as a Relevant Factor for the Responsibility of International Organizations .....                          | 159 |
|     | Emmanuel Roucouas  |     |

PART THREE

PARTICULAR PERSPECTIVES

*International Organizations and Other Entities*

(i) United Nations and Other International Organizations

- |     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| 15. | The ILC's Articles Seen from a WHO Perspective .....  | 177 |
|     | Gian Luca Burci and Clemens Feinäugle   |     |
| 16. | European Exceptionalism in International Law? The European Union and the System of International Responsibility .....                                 | 189 |
|     | José Manuel Cortés Martín   |     |
| 17. | ILC Articles on Responsibility of International Organizations: The Interplay between the Practice and the Rule (A View from the United Nations) ..... | 201 |
|     | Daphna Shrager  |     |

(ii) International Financial Institutions

- |     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 18. | United in Joy and Sorrow: Some Considerations on Responsibility Issues under Partnerships among International Financial Institutions .....           | 213 |
|     | Laurence Boisson de Chazournes   |     |
| 19. | Codification, Progressive Development or Innovation? Some Reflections on the ILC Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations ..... | 225 |
|     | Ross Leckow and Erik Plith   |     |
| 20. | The World Bank and the ILC's Project on the Responsibility of International Organizations .....  | 235 |
|     | Maurizio Ragazzi   |     |

## (iii) Other Entities

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 21. The Responsibility of International Organizations: Selected Reflections from the Perspective of a Former Legal Counsel to the Holy See ..... | 251 |
| Robert John Araujo   |     |
| 22. The Elusive Allocation of Responsibility to Informal Organizations: The Case of the Quartet on the Middle East .....                         | 261 |
| John Dugard and Annemarieke Vermeer-Künzli   |     |
| 23. Attribution of Conduct after the Advisory Opinion on the Global Mechanism .....  | 275 |
| Rutzel Silvestre J. Martha   |     |

## PART FOUR

## SPECIAL CONCERNS

*Selected Issues Regarding the Articles*

## (i) Responsibility and Member States

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 24. Responsibility of Member States towards Third Parties for an Internationally Wrongful Act of the Organization .....        | 293 |
| Kazuhiro Nakatani  |     |
| 25. Exploring Alternative Routes: The Obligation of Members to Enable the Organization to Make Reparation .....                | 303 |
| Paolo Palchetti  |     |
| 26. The Responsibility of International Organizations and Their Member States .....  | 313 |
| Pavel Šturma   |     |
| 27. 'Member Responsibility' and the ILC Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations: Some Observations ..... | 325 |
| Sienho Yee   |     |

## (ii) Responsibility and the Courts/Countermeasures

28. Responsibility of International Organizations and Justiciability of Disputes .....	339
Sergio Puig	
29. Responsibility of International Organizations: What Role for the International Court of Justice? .....	351
Hugh Thirlway	
30. The Countermeasure of Disobedience: Implementing the Responsibility of International Organizations .....	361
Antonios Tzanakopoulos	
31. Countermeasures by Member States Against International Organizations .....	373
Simone Vezzani	

## (iii) Use of Force/Peacekeeping Operations

32. The Notion of 'Effective Control' under the Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations .....	389
Blanca Montejo	
33. United Nations Responsibility from Authorizing the Use of Force .....	405
P.S. Rao	
34. International Responsibility for the Conduct of 'Blue Helmets': Exploring the Organic Link .....	415
Francesco Salerno	
Appendix 1 United Nations General Assembly Resolution 66/100, Responsibility of International Organizations (Adopted on December 9, 2011) .....	429
Appendix 2 International Law Commission's General Commentary on the Articles .....	449
Bibliography .....	453
Index .....	467