Responsibility of International Organizations

Essays in Memory of Sir Ian Brownlie

Edited by
Maurizio Ragazzi

LEIDEN • BOSTON
2013
CONTENTS

Editor's Preface ........................................................................................................ xi
Sir Ian Brownlie—Summary Biography and Select Bibliography ............... xv
Contributors ............................................................................................................. xix
Table of Cases .......................................................................................................... xxv
Table of Documents ............................................................................................... xxxi
List of Abbreviations .............................................................................................. xliii

PART ONE

SETTING THE STAGE

International Organizations' Responsibility between
Codification and Progressive Development

1. Some Reflections on Basic Issues Concerning the Responsibility of
   International Organizations ................................................................................... 3
   Antônio Augusto Cançado Trindade

2. The Processes of Law-Making: The Law Relating to International Organizations as an Example ........................................................................................................ 15
   Kenneth Keith

3. Codification, Progressive Development, or Scholarly Analysis?
   The Art of Packaging the ILC’s Work Product .................................................. 29
   Sean D. Murphy

4. International Organizations Are Definitely Not States.
   Cursory Remarks on the ILC Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations ........................................................................................................ 41
   Alain Pellet
CONTENTS

5. ‘Weighing’ the Articles on Responsibility of International Organizations ................................. 55
   Michael Wood

PART TWO
ASSESSING THE COMMISSION’S APPROACH
State Responsibility and Responsibility of International Organizations

(i) General Considerations

6. An Assessment of the ILC’s Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations .................. 71
   C.F. Amerasinghe

7. International Organizations and State Responsibility ................................................................. 79
   Dan Sarooshi

8. Viability of the ILC’s Articles Formulated on the Basis of the Articles on State Responsibility ................ 89
   Chusei Yamada

(ii) Comparing the Two Sets of Articles

9. Parallel Worlds, Parallel Clauses: Remarks on the Relationship between the Two Sets of ILC Articles on International Responsibility and the UN Charter ............................................ 97
   Maurizio Arcari

    Vincent-Joël Proulx

11. Within and Beyond Mutatis Mutandis ......................................................................................... 121
    Tullio Scovazzi

(iii) Lex Specialis/Rules of the Organization

12. The Role of Lex Specialis in the Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations ................ 135
    Kristen E. Boon
CONTENTS

13. Reflections on the Scope of Application of the Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations .............................. 147
   Arnold N. Pronto

14. Practice as a Relevant Factor for the Responsibility of International Organizations ......................................................... 159
   Emmanuel Roucounas

PART THREE

PARTICULAR PERSPECTIVES

*International Organizations and Other Entities*

(i) United Nations and Other International Organizations

15. The ILC's Articles Seen from a WHO Perspective ......................................................... 177
   Gian Luca Burci and Clemens Feinaugle

16. European Exceptionalism in International Law? The European Union and the System of International Responsibility ......................... 189
   Jose Manuel Cortés Martin

17. ILC Articles on Responsibility of International Organizations: The Interplay between the Practice and the Rule (A View from the United Nations) .............................................................. 201
   Daphna Shraga

(ii) International Financial Institutions

   Laurence Boisson de Chazournes

   Ross Leckow and Erik Plith

20. The World Bank and the ILC's Project on the Responsibility of International Organizations ................................................................. 235
   Maurizio Ragazzi
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(iii) Other Entities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21. The Responsibility of International Organizations: Selected Reflections from the Perspective of a Former Legal Counsel to the Holy See .......................................................... 251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert John Araujo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. The Elusive Allocation of Responsibility to Informal Organizations: The Case of the Quartet on the Middle East .......................................................... 261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Dugard and Annemarieke Vermeer-Künzli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Attribution of Conduct after the Advisory Opinion on the Global Mechanism .......................................................... 275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rutsel Silvestre J. Martha</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART FOUR**

**SPECIAL CONCERNS**

Selected Issues Regarding the Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(i) Responsibility and Member States</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24. Responsibility of Member States towards Third Parties for an Internationally Wrongful Act of the Organization .......................................................... 293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazuhiro Nakatani</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Exploring Alternative Routes: The Obligation of Members to Enable the Organization to Make Reparation .......................................................... 303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paolo Palchetti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. The Responsibility of International Organizations and Their Member States .......................................................... 313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pavel Šturma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. 'Member Responsibility' and the ILC Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations: Some Observations .......................................................... 325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sienho Yee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(ii) Responsibility and the Courts/Countermeasures

28. Responsibility of International Organizations and Justiciability of Disputes ................................................................. 339
   Sergio Puig

   Hugh Thirlway

30. The Countermeasure of Disobedience: Implementing the Responsibility of International Organizations ........................... 361
   Antonios Tzanakopoulos

31. Countermeasures by Member States Against International Organizations ........................................................................ 373
   Simone Vezzani

(iii) Use of Force/Peacekeeping Operations

32. The Notion of 'Effective Control' under the Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations .......................... 389
   Blanca Montejo

33. United Nations Responsibility from Authorizing the Use of Force .... 405
   P.S. Rao

34. International Responsibility for the Conduct of 'Blue Helmets': Exploring the Organic Link ............................................... 415
   Francesco Salerno

Appendix 1 United Nations General Assembly Resolution 66/100, Responsibility of International Organizations (Adopted on December 9, 2011) 429
Appendix 2 International Law Commission's General Commentary on the Articles ........................................................................ 449
Bibliography .............................................................................................................. 453
Index .......................................................................................................................... 467