## TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Foreword* ........................................................................................................................................ pag. XV

**Chapter 1**

*Introductory profiles, method and objectives of the study*

1.1. Subject matter and outline of the research ................................................................. » 1
1.2. Reasons for investigating the relationship between international trade and climate change ................................................................. » 2
1.3. The concept of ‘climate’ from a legal standpoint: preliminary remarks ........................................................................................................... » 4
1.4. Climate change, international trade and sustainable development ........ » 6
1.5. Methodological remarks .......................................................................................... » 13
1.6. Delimitation of the ambit of the research and definition of its aim ...... » 16

**Part 1**

*Setting the scene: the relationship between climate and trade in the context of the trade-environment debate*

Introduction ................................................................................................................................... » 21

**Chapter 2**

*The climate change challenge in the context of international trade*

2.1. Preliminary remarks ........................................................................................................ » 23
2.2. The causes of climate change and the international community’s acknowledgment ................................................................................................ » 26
2.3. The effects of climate change ....................................................................................... » 29
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.4. Climate migration and international trade ............................................. pag. 33
   2.4.1. Preliminary remarks ......................................................................... » 35
   2.4.2. Analyzing the impacts ..................................................................... » 37
   2.4.3. The climate migration and trade nexus in its reverse: the international trade system, climate change and climate migration .................................................................................... » 38
   2.4.4. Applying the exceptions of the WTO Agreements to the scenario of climate change-induced migrations ................................................. » 40

Chapter 3

*Environmental protection and the international trade system*

3.1. Preliminary remarks .............................................................................. » 47
3.2. Background to relevant legal instruments ............................................ » 49
   a) The Montreal Protocol ............................................................................. » 50
   b) The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species ................................................................. » 50
   c) The Basel Convention ............................................................................. » 51
   d) The Cartagena Protocol to the Convention on Biological diversity ................................................................................................. » 52
3.3. The WTO and the environment ............................................................. » 53
   3.3.1. Principal legal aspects ......................................................................... » 53
   3.3.2. Dispute settlement resolution within the WTO ............................... » 55
   3.3.3. The proportionality principle in WTO ............................................. » 57
   3.3.4. Eco-labelling and the WTO ............................................................... » 69
3.4. Unilateral trade-related climate change measure: preliminary remarks .. » 80
   3.4.1. An overview .......................................................................................... » 80
   3.4.2. The WTO and subsidies for renewable energy .............................. » 83
   3.4.3. EU Emissions Trading Scheme ......................................................... » 91
   3.4.4. Concluding remarks on the practice of unilateral trade-related climate change mitigation measures .......................................................... » 107

Part II

*The current state of play in climate change mitigation efforts: the international climate regime*

Introduction ........................................................................................................ » 111
## Chapter 4

The normative framework of the climate regime: the 1992 UN Framework Climate Convention and the subsequent work of the Conference of the Parties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Preliminary remarks</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Normative framework of the climate regime</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1. Object and purpose of the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2. Principles of the 1992 Framework Convention and of the Kyoto Protocol</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3. Obligations</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4. The ‘Flexibility Mechanisms’ of the climate regime: preliminary remarks</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. The Berlin Mandate (1995) and the work of the Conference of the Parties between 1995-1997</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4. The Kyoto Protocol (COP-3, 1997)</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1. Stronger GHG emission reduction commitments (targets)</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2. The content of the negotiations</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6. The Copenhagen Accord (2009), the Cancun Agreements (2010) and the Durban Platform (2011)</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.2. The Cancun Agreements (2010)</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.3. The Durban Agreement (2011)</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.3.1. Extension of the Kyoto Protocol to a second commitment period</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.3.2. The Durban Platform</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.3.3. Creation of the institutions outlined in the Cancun Agreements</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.3.4. Overall assessment</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7. Concluding remarks</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 5

Analyzing the ‘flexibility mechanisms’ of the Kyoto Protocol

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1. Preliminary remarks</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2. The ‘flexibility mechanisms’ of the climate regime: *International Emissions Trading* ................................................................. pag. 151
5.2.1. Private participation ................................................................. » 151
5.2.2. The global carbon market and ‘linking’ of domestic trading schemes ....................................................................................... » 153
5.2.3. Supplementarity to domestic action ........................................... » 156
5.2.4. In sum .................................................................................... » 156
5.3. The ‘flexibility mechanisms’ of the climate regime: the *Clean Development Mechanism* ........................................................ » 157
5.3.1. Additionality ............................................................................... » 159
5.3.2. Prospects....................................................................................... » 159
5.4. The ‘flexibility mechanisms’ of the climate regime: *Joint Implementation* .......................................................... » 161
5.5. Concluding remarks ..................................................................... » 162

Part III

*Conflicts between climate measures and WTO law*

Introduction ................................................................................. » 167

Chapter 6

*The origin of normative conflicts: ‘fragmentation’ of international law*

6.1. Preliminary remarks ................................................................. » 173
6.2. Conflicts of norms .................................................................... » 176
6.3. Definitions .................................................................................. » 176
6.4. ‘Permissive’ norms in the climate regime ..................................... » 178

Chapter 7

*‘Climate measures’ and WTO law: general comments*

7.1. Preliminary remarks ................................................................. » 181
7.2. Limitation of scope of the measures ........................................... » 182
7.3. General compatibility of the objectives ..................................... » 182
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Chapter 8

International Emissions Trading and WTO rules

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1.</td>
<td>Preliminary remarks</td>
<td>pag. 185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.</td>
<td>WTO concerns of sovereign exchanges in ‘emission units’</td>
<td>» 186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.</td>
<td>WTO concerns of private exchanges in ‘emission units’</td>
<td>» 189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.1.</td>
<td>Private trading with ‘emission units’ and GATT rules</td>
<td>» 189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.2.</td>
<td>Are all ‘emission units’ like products?</td>
<td>» 192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.</td>
<td>Emissions trading affecting existing markets</td>
<td>» 193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.1.</td>
<td>Import and sale of energy products</td>
<td>» 193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.2.</td>
<td>Electricity as an energy product</td>
<td>» 195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.3.</td>
<td>Energy imports and national treatment rule</td>
<td>» 195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.4.</td>
<td>Like or directly competitive or substitutable products</td>
<td>» 196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.5.</td>
<td>No less-favourable treatment or effective equality of competitive conditions</td>
<td>» 197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.6.</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>» 199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.</td>
<td>GATT exception clauses</td>
<td>» 199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.1.</td>
<td>GATT Article XX letter g): relating to the conservation of exhaustible natural resources</td>
<td>» 199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.2.</td>
<td>GATT Article XX letter b): necessary to protect human, animal or plant life or health</td>
<td>» 202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.3.</td>
<td>Chapeau of GATT Article XX</td>
<td>» 203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6.</td>
<td>Conclusions on the trade-related impact of International Emissions Trading rules</td>
<td>» 206</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 9

The Clean Developed Mechanism and WTO rules

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1.</td>
<td>Preliminary remarks</td>
<td>» 207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.</td>
<td>Clean Development Mechanism activities as services under the GATS</td>
<td>» 209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.</td>
<td>Participation in Clean Development Mechanism activities and discrimination</td>
<td>» 213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.</td>
<td>GATS exception clauses</td>
<td>» 219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.1.</td>
<td>Policy in respect of the measure</td>
<td>» 219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.2.</td>
<td>Necessity</td>
<td>» 220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.3.</td>
<td>Chapeau</td>
<td>» 223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5.</td>
<td>National development priorities under the Clean Development Mechanism</td>
<td>» 226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9.6. Conclusions on the trade-related impact of the Clean Development Mechanism rules ............................................................... pag. 228

Concluding remarks on Part III .......................................................... » 229

Part IV

A possible solution:

sustainable development as a ‘principle of integration’
of climate and trade law

Chapter 10

The relevance of the principle of sustainable development as
a general principle of international law

Introduction ................................................................................................ » 233

Section I

Origins and development of the concept of sustainable development
in international law

10.1. A concept with ancient roots? .......................................................... » 234
10.2. Sustainable development’s rise in the international order ............... » 235
10.3. Sustainable development in international treaty law ...................... » 241
10.4. Sustainable development in regional and national laws ................. » 243
10.5. The ‘new millennium’ .................................................................... » 245
10.6. Recent legal and political developments ........................................... » 249
10.7. In sum ............................................................................................. » 251

Section II

Integration as a central aspect of sustainable development

10.8. Preliminary remarks ........................................................................ » 253
10.9. Integration within the limits of ecological thresholds ..................... » 256
10.10. Climate sustainability: an ecological threshold ............................. » 258
10.11. Scientific uncertainty ..................................................................... » 263
10.12. Environmentalism and sustainable development ........................... » 264
TABLE OF CONTENTS

10.13. Integration and trans-generational ‘justice’ ........................................ pag. 266

Section III
Sustainable development in the context of international climate change law

10.15. Preliminary remarks ......................................................................... » 271
10.16. References to sustainable development in the UNFCCC ................. » 274
10.17. References to sustainable development in the Kyoto Protocol and subsequent documents ................................................................. » 275
10.18. Implicit references to sustainable development ................................ ... 277
  10.18.1. Intra-generational equity: differentiation, partnership and funding ................................................................. » 277
  10.18.2. Inter-generational equity ....................................................... » 284
  10.18.3. Economic flexibility ............................................................... » 286
10.19. Concluding remarks on the content and role of sustainable development in the context of the climate regime ......................... » 292

Section IV
Sustainable development in WTO context

10.20. Preliminary remarks .............................................................................. » 293
10.21. Sustainable development and trade law ............................................. » 294
10.22. References to sustainable development in WTO law ......................... » 296
  10.22.1. WTO Agreement .................................................................. » 296
  10.22.2. Institutional developments ................................................... » 299
  10.22.3. WTO 2001-2006 Doha Development Agenda ...................... » 302
  10.22.4. WTO dispute settlement ...................................................... » 303
  10.22.5. Invocation of sustainable development in WTO law: procedural and substantive requirements ............................................. » 308
10.23. In sum ................................................................................................ » 310

Section V
Sustainable development as a general principle of international law

10.24. Preliminary remarks ............................................................................. » 311
10.25. Limitation of scope ............................................................................. » 313
10.26. General principles in international law: their characters, function and the objection of indeterminacy .................................................. » 313
10.27. Sustainable development as a general principle ................................. » 317
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

10.28. The role of judiciary in promoting sustainable development.............. pag. 328
10.29. Concluding remarks ................................................................. » 330

Chapter 11

*Sustainable development as a judicial ‘principle of integration’ of (and of conflict resolution between) climate and trade rules*

Introduction .......................................................................................... » 331

Section I

*Is there the need for the principle of sustainable development in WTO dispute settlement?*

11.1. Preliminary remarks ................................................................. » 332
11.2. Interpretation in international adjudication .............................. » 333
11.3. Interpretation of WTO norms: principles and their limitation ....... » 336
11.4. Conclusions ............................................................................. » 354

Section II

*Principles of conflict resolution*

11.5. Explicit conflict clauses ............................................................. » 357
11.6. Implicit conflict clauses in the Kyoto Protocol and in the UN Framework Convention ................................................. » 359
11.7. *Lex specialis derogat legi generali* ............................................. » 363
11.8. *Lex posterior derogat legi priori* ............................................... » 365
11.9. Conclusions ............................................................................. » 367

Section III

*Applicability of ‘non-WTO’ law in WTO dispute settlement*

11.10. WTO dispute settlement and public international law ............... » 368
11.11. *Jurisdiction* and applicable law in WTO dispute settlement .......... » 369
11.12. Sources of ‘non-WTO’ law in WTO dispute settlement ............... » 373
11.13. In sum ..................................................................................... » 377
Section IV

Applicability of the principle of sustainable development in WTO dispute settlement

11.14. Applicability as a part of WTO law .......................................................... pag. 378
11.15. Applicability as a general principle of law ............................................. » 379
11.16. Mandatory or non-mandatory application? ............................................. » 379
11.17. Dispute settlement authority and ‘judicial activism’............................... » 381
11.18. In sum ..................................................................................................... » 382

Chapter 12

Application of the principle of sustainable development: practical consequences and case studies

Section I

Practical consequences of the application of the principle of sustainable development

12.1. The aim of creating coherence ............................................................... » 385
12.2. Nature of a ‘legal test’ for sustainable development ................................ » 387
12.3. Possible elements of a ‘legal test’ for sustainable development .......... » 390

Section II

Case studies: Applicability of the ‘legal test’ for sustainable development
to the ‘flexibility mechanism’ of the Kyoto Protocol

12.4. Introduction ............................................................................................. » 399
12.5. Applicability of the ‘legal test’ for sustainable development to the
Clean Development Mechanism................................................................. » 399
12.6. Applicability of the ‘legal test’ for sustainable development to Emissions
Trading ......................................................................................................... » 407
12.7. Summary ................................................................................................ » 419

Final conclusions

13.1. Areas of conflict between climate measures and WTO law ............... » 421
13.2. Inherent limitations of other instruments of conflict avoidance/resolution
and a possible solution to the ‘climate-trade conflicts’: the principle of
sustainable development................................................................. » 423
13.3. Sustainable development in climate change and international trade law .............................................................................................................................. pag. 423
13.4. Sustainable development as a legal ‘instrument of integration’ .......... » 424
13.5. Application of the principle of sustainable development in the context of climate and trade conflicts ................................................................. » 425

List of writings cited ................................................................................................. » 429

Index ................................................................................................................................ » 463