GENERAL INTERESTS OF HOST STATES IN INTERNATIONAL INVESTMENT LAW

It is a function of sovereign States to take action in order to maintain their financial stability, stimulate economic development or to further their non-economic interests such as health, the environment and food security. However, such measures can conflict with the rights granted to foreign investors under international treaties. Regulators and policy makers must take into account international commitments towards foreign investors when making decisions and when negotiating must also avoid reverting to protectionism in drafting new treaties.

With this tension in mind, this book offers a balanced reappraisal of bilateral treaties and regional agreements on foreign investments. The sensitive issues are examined in the light of the case law of arbitral investment tribunals and other international courts, and the analysis highlights how cross-territoriality between trade and investment law can assist in resolving conflicts.

GIORGIO SACCODOTTI is Professor of International and Environmental Law at Bocconi University, Milan, Italy. He is an internationally recognised expert on both investment and trade law, having been both a member of the WTO Appellate Body and an investment arbitrator at ICSID.

PIA ACCONE is Professor of European Union Law at the University of Trento, Italy, where her research focuses on the social responsibility of multinational companies and the relationship between international regulation of trade and investment and non-economic matters such as the protection of public health.

MARA VALENTI is a Lecturer in International Law at the Department of International Studies, University of Milan, Italy, teaching International Organization. Her research focuses on International Investment Law.

ANNA DE LUCA is a Researcher at Bocconi University, Milan, Italy, and a practising lawyer. Her research focuses on International Investment Law and EU Investment Policy.
CONTENTS

Notes on contributors page x
Editors’ preface xv

PART 1 General interests of host States in the application of investment treaties 1

1 The application of BITs in time of economic crisis: limits to their coverage, necessity and the relevance of WTO law 3
GIORGIO SACERDOTTI

2 The protection of general interests of host States in the application of the fair and equitable treatment standard 26
MARA VALENTI

3 Indirect expropriations and regulatory takings: what role for the “legitimate expectations” of foreign investors? 58
ANNA DE LUCA

4 Trade and investment law: what relations? 76
FRIEDRICH MEISEL

5 On the evolution and slow convergence of international trade and investment law 104
JÖRGHEM KURTZE

6 Sovereign wealth funds as protected investors under BITs and the safeguard of the national security of host States 130
Michele BARRIERI

vii
PART II  The protection of non-investment concerns in international investment law 163
7 The integration of non-investment concerns as an opportunity for the modernization of international investment law: a multilateral approach desirable?  165
Pia Acciai
8 Intellectual property protection in investment agreements and public concerns 194
Antonietta Di Blase
9 Up-keeping non-economic values in development assistance: does the World Bank practice what it preaches? Answers from the Inspection Panel 238
Agustina Latino
10 The protection of indigenous peoples’ concerns in World Bank-funded projects 257
Martina Guidi
PART III  The protection of general interests of host States and the EU as a new player in the investment arena 263
11 The future of BITs between EU Member States: are intra-EU BITs compatible with the internal market? 265
Paola Mariani
12 European Union restrictions to the free movement of capital v. BITs: guarantee or learning from the European Court of Justice case law 287
Ella Milanesh
13 Ensuring the consistency of the EU investment policy within the EU external action: the relevance of non-trade values 308
Alessandro Persetti
14 Non-financial concerns in the lending policy of the European Investment Bank in context 325
Changela Pistoria

PART IV  The protection of general interests of host States in the trade and investment context: other regional perspectives 355
15 The protection of general interests of host States in regional agreements in the Asia-Pacific Area 357
Claudio Dorbi and Dai ten Thien
16 The regulation of foreign investments in Mercosur: failed attempts and challenges ahead 378
Antonio Dal Re and Paolo Popara de Alcântara Veloso
PART V  The protection of general interests of host States from the Italian perspective 397
17 Italy’s treaty practice and case-law: what balance between investors’ protection and general interests of host States? 399
Federico Ortimo and Domenico di Pistro
18 Diplomatic intervention and State-to-State arbitration as alternative means for the protection of foreign investments and host States’ general interests: the Italian experience 427
Matilde Reganati
Index 445
CONTRIBUTORS

PIA ACCONCI (Co-editor) is a professor of International Investment Law and European Union Law at the University of Terni, Italy. She holds a PhD in International Economic Law from the University of Bergamo. She was awarded the special prize ‘eccellenza nella ricerca’ (Excellency in Research) at Bocconi University, Milan in 2002. She was a member of the ILA Committee on the Law of Foreign Investment from 2004 to 2008. She has been a member of the editorial staff of the Italian Yearbook of International Law since 2005. She has authored many works, in particular two books: Il colgimento tra Stato e società in materia di investimenti stranieri (The Link between State and Company in the Field of Foreign Investments, CEDAM, 2002) and Tutela della salute e diritti internazionali (Health Protection and International Law, CEDAM, 2011). Her writings mainly concern international investment law, corporate social responsibility in international law and European Union law, human rights protection and health issues in international law.

MICHELE BARBERI is currently with an international financial and tax consultancy in Luxembourg. He holds a PhD from Bocconi University, Milan, where he was a research assistant in International and EU Law. Previously he was a visiting lecturer in International Investment Law at the Belarus State Economic University, where he contributed to the reform of the investment code of Belarus.

ARNO DAHL JUNIOR is professor of International Law at Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Brazil. He earned a PhD in International Law and Economics from Bocconi University, Milan, and a Master's degree in European Union Law and Policies from the University of Padova, Italy.

PAOLO POTETRA DE ACCELTERA VELOSO teaches International Law at Faculdade de Ciências Sociais de Florianópolis (CESUSC), Brazil. He is a PhD candidate at Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Brazil, and a researcher with the Research Groups in International Law Ius Gentium and in History of Law Ius Commune (UFSC/CNPq).

ANGUS DE LUCA (Co-editor) is a research fellow at Bocconi University in Milan and holds a PhD from the State University of Milan. She specialises in international investment law and arbitration, and EU investment policy. She is a member of the editorial committee of the Rivista dell' Arbitrato and a practicing lawyer in the field of investment arbitration as a member of the Milan Bar. Besides several articles in international yearbooks and Italian law reviews, she authored in 2013 La competenza dell'Unione europea sugli investimenti esteri (Giappichelli, Torino).

ANTONIETTA DI BLASE is Professor of International Law at Roma Tre University Law School. Previously Prof. Di Blase taught International Law at the Universities of Bologna, LUSS in Rome and Cattolica, where she was also Dean of the Law School. She has published widely in the area of international law and international economic law.

DOMENICO DI PIETRO practices international arbitration both as counsel and as an arbitrator in Rome where he lectures on International Arbitration at Roma Tre University. He was a fellow of the Center for Transnational Litigation and Commercial Law at New York University School of Law. He is qualified to practice in Italy and in England and Wales.

CLAUDIO DOUM, PhD, is Associate Professor of International Law at Bocconi University, Milan. He has worked as a consultant for a number of international organisations (APEC, ASEAN, EU, UNCTAD, UNDP, World Bank). He has taught and researched in a number of American, European and Asian universities and has published in the main international economic law journals. Since 2008 he has also been Technical Assistance Team Leader of the EU Multilateral Trade and Investment project in Vietnam.

MARTINA DUONG holds a PhD in International and EU Law. She is currently a Research Fellow at LUSS University in Rome. Her writings mainly concern corporate social responsibility, the protection of the environment and of human rights in international and European Union law.

Jürgen Kuzat is an associate professor and Director of the International Investment Law Program of the Institute for International Law and the Humanities at the University of Melbourne. He researches and teaches in the various strands of international economic law including WTO and investment law on which he has published in leading international law journals. He teaches annually at the Academy of International Trade and Investment Law in Macau, and at Master programmes at Universidade Católica in Portugal, at the University of Barcelona and at the Singapore International Arbitration Academy. He was recently appointed P. Braudel Senior Fellow at the European University Institute.

Agnieszka Latina is Research Fellow in International Law at the University of Camerino, Italy, and Lectures in International Economic Law at Roma Tre University. She holds an LLM and an MBA from LUiss University in Rome and a PhD from the University of Bari, Italy.

Paola Mariani is Associate Professor of International Law and EU Law at Bocconi University, Milan, where she has been in charge of the courses of private international law and EU law since 2001. Mariani’s research interests focus on the international fight against corruption, EU external relations, EU private international law and the EU internal market, on which subjects she has published in Italian and European journals.

Elisabetta Mulardi is a researcher and lecturer in European Law at the University of Milan (Political Sciences). Her publications cover subjects in international law and EU law, the latter mainly focused on the fiscal policy of the European Union.

Federico Orsino PhD is Reader in International Economic Law at King’s College London, He joined King’s in 2007. He is a member of the ILA Committee on International Trade Law, founding Committee Member (and now Co-treasurer) of the Society of International Economic Law; consultative member of the Investment Treaty Forum; editorial board member of the Journal of International Economic Law, the Yearbook on International Investment Law and Policy and the Journal of International Dispute Settlement.

Alkeiburo Perpetu holds a PhD from the University of Teramo, Italy, where he is a teaching fellow. He specialized in European Union Law and has written in Italian academic journals on anti-dumping, corporate social responsibility, food security, customs cooperation and foreign investment regimes.

Manuela Pithou is Associate Professor of European Union Law at the University of Teramo, Italy. She holds a PhD in International Organizations. Her research interest is in the area of non-economic values in EU economic law covers corporate social responsibility. She has published on environmental performance certification in the EU (EcoLogo) and on the support to CSR by means of legal instruments in the EU system.

Matteo Recanati holds a PhD from Macerata University, Italy, and is currently Research Fellow at Bocconi University in Milan. Her area of expertise is international economic law, specifically in that of international trade and investment on which she has published articles in books and journals both in Italian and non-Italian publications. Before Bocconi she practiced with international law firms in Hong Kong and Shanghai.

Georgio Sacerdoti (Editor) has been Professor of International Law at Bocconi University in Milan since 1996, holding also the Jean Monnet Chair in European Law. He was a member of the WTO Appellate Body from 2001 to 2009 and its chairman in 2006–7. Previously he had been the Vice President of the OECD Working Group on Bribery in International Business Transactions (1991–2001) where he was one of the negotiators of the 1997 OECD Anti-Bribery Convention. He is on the ICCID Panel of Arbitrators (designated by Italy) where he has chaired various tribunals in high profile cases. An editor of the Italian Yearbook of International Law, he has lectured extensively in universities and at conferences around the world including as Senior P. Braudel Fellow at the European University Institute in 2012. He has authored more than 150 works in his fields of interest, combining his international trade and investment law expertise, including the first course on investment law at the Hague Academy in 1994. He is also active in international commercial arbitration as an independent arbitrator and as counsel to Everisildt Blanchet in Milan.

Kai Van Trinh has been a lecturer in International Law at the Diplomatic Academy of Vietnam since 2001. He has also been a visiting lecturer at the Hanoi University of Law and the Hanoi University and Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences. Trinh graduated in International Relations from Vietnam’s Institute for International Relations and completed
Mara Valenti is a researcher in International Law at the University of Milan focusing on international investment law. She is the author of Glisstandardi di trattamento nell'interpretazione dei trattati in materia di investimenti stranieri (Giappichelli, Torino, 2009). She is a lecturer on the Law of International Organizations at her university and teaches at the PhD in International Law and Economics at Bocconi University, Milan. She holds a PhD in International Law and Economics from Bocconi and a Diploma d'Études Supérieures in EU Law from Université Paris 1 - Panthéon Sorbonne.

Priscilla Weir is a professor in the Department of European, International and Comparative Law of the University of Vienna. He was formerly a lecturer at LSE, London, and a professor of International (Economic) Law and Organisations at the University of Amsterdam where he was also Director of the Amsterdam Law School. His publications include EU Recht (co-authored and co-edited with G. Hafner and A. Kumin; Mainz, 2010); Free Movement of Persons within the European Community (with Frank Woldridge, European Monographs, Kluwer, 2nd edition 2007); International Law and Sustainable Development: Principles and Practice (co-edited with Nico Schrijver; Brill, 2004).

This volume brings together sixteen specialists, mostly academics but also practising lawyers in the field of international investment and trade law. The focus of their contributions is primarily the protection of general interest of host States under bilateral investment treaties and other agreements, and on how to reconcile this concern with the traditional primary focus of these treaties, namely the protection of foreign investors.

The issue of safeguarding the policy space of host States when they adopt general regulations and measures in the pursuit of public interest which are liable to prejudice and discriminate against foreign investors has come to the forefront with the recent economic and financial crises. Prudential and other urgent measures for the preservation of financial stability and the viability of the banking system have been accused of being discriminatory against foreign business entities and investors. Already before the crisis, the challenge of general measures by aggrieved investors in high profile arbitral litigation, resulting in huge amounts being awarded to claimants at the cost of host States' budgets, has raised the issue of the proper limits of the protection afforded by Bilateral Investment Treaties (BITs) against general measures and regulation that may qualify as indirect expropriation. This would extend treaty coverage well beyond the traditional core protection against arbitrary, discriminatory and confiscatory measures.

As a result, the very legitimacy of BITs and of the direct arbitral dispute settlement process they establish has been questioned. A few countries are opting out of the system or at least signalling their rejection of direct investor-State arbitration. This would mean re-politicising investment disputes and discriminating against investors from weaker countries unable to obtain effective diplomatic protection from their home States. The process of negotiating new treaties goes on, however, to the point of involving the two largest world economies, the United States and China. The trend includes major regional trade agreements containing investment chapters, on the model of NAFTA, being negotiated in the
Transatlantic and Transpacific arenas as well as in the Far East. In all of these negotiating fora, new clauses are being devised, with a view to shielding host States from potentially abusive claims by investors against bona fide non-discriminatory general regulation in the public interest. This evolution puts pressure on arbitral case law and should encourage both treaty negotiators and arbitrators to look at WTO law and its jurisprudence for a model of a multilateral, more balanced and legitimate system.

Finally, given the active role of the European Parliament in shaping the investment policy of the European Union, the EU may well become not just a new actor but a new type of actor in the evolution of investment law and policies. Current negotiations of investment chapters in free trade agreements and economic partnership agreements between the EU and major trade partners can contribute to the emergence of a new pattern in international investment law that is more deferent to the general interests of host States.

This collection of chapters investigates systematically these current pressing issues from a variety of points of view. Most of them stem from a collective research on the evolution of international investment law, financed by the Italian Ministry of Education and University (PRIN project 2008–12, Grant No. 402366). The European dimension has been added, with chapters by authors from various other countries, thanks to the participation of Bocconi University through its International Law and Economics programme of the PhD School in the Marie Curie "DISSETTLE" (economic dispute settlement) doctoral and post-doctoral programme, financed by the European Commission (Grant No. 264653). This project links the Geneva Graduate Institute, Université Libre de Brussel and the Universities of St Gallen, Warsaw and Bocconi, focusing on both the legal and economic dimensions of investment, trade and competition international dispute settlement. The Editors thank Dr. Geraldo Vidal and Dr Emily Lodge, the DISSETTLE researchers at Bocconi University, for their valuable assistance with the final revision of the volume.