THE GLOBAL COMMUNITY

Yearbook of International Law and Jurisprudence

2015

Edited by

Giuliana Ziccardi Capaldo

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Aims & Scope xvii
Outline of the Sections xix

EDITORIAL

Global Law as a Constitutional Phenomenon 3
Giuliana Ziccardi Capaldo

PART 1: ARTICLES

The Decay of Modern Customary International Law in Spite of Scholarly Heroism 9
Jean d'Aspremont

Globalization's Law: Transnational, Global or Both? 31
Frank J. Garcia

Are Those Norms Truly Peremptory? With Special Reference to Human Rights Law and International Humanitarian Law 47
Rafael Nieto-Navia

UN War Crimes Commission and International Law: Revisiting World War II Precedents and Practice 71
Dan Plesch, Thomas G. Weiss, & Leah Owen

PART 2: NOTES AND COMMENTS

From Totus Orbis to Global Law 113
Pablo Antonio Fernández Sánchez

East Meets West in Civil Disobedience Theory and Beyond: Lessons From Mohandas K. Gandhi and Martin Luther King, Jr. 125
Karen C. Sokol
### PART 3: IN FOCUS—GLOBAL POLICIES AND LAW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Human Rights and the Politics of Religious Freedom in Europe</td>
<td>Jeffrey Haynes</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Win-Win Formula for Reforming the UN Security Council</td>
<td>Vesselin Popovski</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balancing Competing Interests and Values: Drone Strikes as National</td>
<td>Ramesh Thakur</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy but International Crime?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Appendix of the Section**—Topics Covered in the Previous Issues (2008–2014) 201

### PART 4: FORUM—JURISPRUDENTIAL CROSS-FERTILIZATION: AN ANNUAL OVERVIEW

**I. Introductory Module—MISSION AND CONCEPTS** 207

**I.1 Contemporary International Tribunals: Jurisprudential Cross-Fertilization in Their Common Mission of Realization of Justice, Antônio Augusto Cançado Trindade** 209

**II. Module—HUMAN RIGHTS LAW—The Relationship Between Courts of Human Rights and Their Relationship with the ICJ or Another International Court or Arbitral Tribunal** 217

**II.1 A Human Right to a Clean Environment: A Reappraisal, Malgosia Fitzmaurice** 219


**III. Module—ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL LAW—The Relationship Between International Judicial Bodies in Economic Matters and Their Relationship with the ICJ or Another International Court or Arbitral Tribunal** 249

**III.1 Pressure for Transparency and the Use of Arbitration Mechanisms in International Economic Dispute Resolution, Joanna Jemielniak** 251

**IV. Module—INTERNATIONAL AND DOMESTIC LAW—The Relationship between International Courts and Domestic Courts** 273

**IV.1 Universal Jurisdiction over International Crimes and Gross Human Rights Violations: The Role of the Principle of Subsidiarity, Cedric Ryngaert** 275
PART 5: DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND TRIBUNALS IN 2014

Edited by Giuliana Ziccardi Capaldo

Systematic Classification Scheme

I. INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE

I.1 INTRODUCTORY NOTE, John G. Merrills

I.2 LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS FROM SELECTED CASE LAW (Giuliana Ziccardi Capaldo)


Systematic Index of the Sub-Section

II. INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE LAW OF THE SEA

II.1 INTRODUCTORY NOTE, Tullio Treves

II.2 LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS FROM SELECTED CASE LAW (Emilio Sessa)

II.2.1 The M/V "Virginia G" Case (Panama/Guinea-Bissau), Case No. 19, Judgment, 14 April 2014

Systematic Index of the Sub-Section

III. WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT SYSTEM

III.1 INTRODUCTORY NOTE, Joanna Gomula

III.2 LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS FROM SELECTED CASE LAW (Joanna Gomula)


III.2.2 United States—Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Measures on Certain Products from China (WT/DS449/AB/R/), Appellate Body Report issued on 7 July 2014, adopted on 22 July 2014

III.2.3 United States—Countervailing Measures on Certain Hot-Rolled Carbon Steel Flat Products from India (WT/DS436/AB/R/), Appellate Body Report issued on 8 December 2014, adopted on 19 December 2014

Systematic Index of the Sub-Section

IV. INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT

IV.1 INTRODUCTORY NOTE, Geert-Jan Alexander Knoops

IV.2 LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS FROM SELECTED CASE LAW (Anna Oriolo, Emanuele Perrotta, Caterina Tuosto)
IV.2.1 Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo

IV.2.1.1 Le Procureur c. Germain Katanga, Affaire No. ICC-01/04-01/07, Chambre de première instance II, Décision relative à la peine, 23 mai 2014 393

IV.2.1.2 The Prosecutor v. Bosco Ntaganda, Case No. ICC-01/04-02/06, Pre-Trial Chamber II, Decision Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute on the Charges of the Prosecutor Against Bosco Ntaganda, 9 June 2014 396

IV.2.2 Situation in Libya

IV.2.2.1 The Prosecutor v. Saif Al-Islam Gaddafi and Abdullah Al-Senussi, Case No. ICC-01/11-01/11 OA 4, Appeals Chamber, Judgment on the Appeal of Libya Against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I of 31 May 2013 Entitled "Decision on the Admissibility of the Case Against Saif Al-Islam Gaddafi", 21 May 2014 401

IV.2.3 Situation in the Central African Republic

IV.2.3.1 The Prosecutor v. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo, Aimé Kilolo Musamba, Jean-Jacques Mangenda Kabongo, Fidèle Babala Wandu and Narcisse Arido, Case No. ICC-01/05-01/13, Pre-Trial Chamber II, Decision Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute, 11 November 2014 404

IV.2.4 Situation in Cote d’Ivoire

IV.2.4.1 The Prosecutor v. Charles Blé Goudé, Case No. ICC-02/11-02/11, Pre-Trial Chamber I, Decision on the Confirmation of Charges Against Charles Blé Goudé, 11 December 2014 407
VI.2.2 Édouard Karemera and Matthieu Ngirumpatse v. The Prosecutor, Case No. ICTR-98-44-A, Appeals Chamber, Judgement, 29 September 2014 466

VI.2.3 Callixte Nzabonimana v. The Prosecutor, Case No. ICTR-99-44D-A, Appeals Chamber, Judgement, 29 September 2014 472

VI.2.4 Ildéphonse Nizeyimana v. The Prosecutor, Case No. ICTR-00-55C-A, Appeals Chamber, Judgement, 29 September 2014 476

Systematic Index of the Sub-Section 481

VII. COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION 483

VII.1 INTRODUCTORY NOTE, Francesco Seatzu 485

VII.2 GENERAL COURT 495

VII.2.1 LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS FROM SELECTED CASE LAW (Bernd Bertelmann, Caterina Dereatti, Ramona Grimbergen, Giovanna Lanni, Michael George Loizou, Nadia Napoli, Pilar Núñez Ruiz, Cristian Oro Martínez, Ragne Piir, Sabina Ruffo, Alessandro Spano, Luca Terniello, Zsófia Varga, Chen Wu) 497

VII.2.1.1 Luxembourg Pamol (Cyprus) Ltd and Luxembourg Industries Ltd v. European Commission, Case T-578/13 R, Order, 13 February 2014 499

VII.2.1.2 InnoLux Corp. v. European Commission, Case T-91/11, Sixth Chamber, Judgment, 27 February 2014 502

VII.2.1.3 Hani El Sayyed Elsebai Yusef v. European Commission, Case T-306/10, Second Chamber, Judgment, 21 March 2014 505

VII.2.1.4 Federal Republic of Germany v. European Commission, Case T-198/12, Eighth Chamber, Judgment, 14 May 2014 508

VII.2.1.5 Intel Corp. v. European Commission, Case T-286/09, Seventh Chamber, Judgment, 12 June 2014 511

VII.2.1.6 Alchaar c. Conseil de l’Union européenne, Affaire T-203/12, Neuvième Chambre, Arrêt, 3 Juillet 2014 513

VII.2.1.7 DTS Distribuidora de Televisión Digital, SA v. European Commission, Case T-533/10, Third Chamber, Judgment, 11 July 2014 516

VII.2.1.8 Zweckverband Tierkörperbeseitigung c. Commission européenne, Affaire T-309/12, Cinquième Chambre, Arrêt, 16 Juillet 2014 519

VII.2.1.9 Westfälisch-Lippischer Sparkassen- und Giroverband v. European Commission, Case T-457/09, First Chamber (Extended Composition), Judgment, 17 July 2014 522

VII.2.1.10 Éditions Odile Jacob SAS v. European Commission, Case T-471/11, Second Chamber, Judgement, 5 September 2014 526
**VII.2.1.11**  
528

**VII.2.1.12**  
*Schenker AG v European Commission*, Case T-534/11, First Chamber, Judgment, 7 October 2014  
531

**VII.2.1.13**  
*Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (LTTE) v. Council of the European Union*, Joined Cases T-208/11 and T-508/11, Sixth Chamber (Extended Composition), Judgment, 16 October 2014  
534

**VII.2.1.14**  
*Gilbert Szajner v. Office for Harmonisation in the Internal Market (Trade Marks and Designs)* (OHIM), Case T-453/11, First Chamber, Judgment, 21 October 2014  
537

**VII.2.1.15**  
540

**VII.2.1.16**  
*Autogrill España, SA v. European Commission*, Case T-219/10, Second Chamber (Extended Composition), Judgment, 6 November 2014  
543

**VII.2.1.17**  
546

**VII.2.1.18**  
549

**VII.2.1.19**  
552

**VII.2.1.20**  
*The Coca-Cola Company v. Office for Harmonisation in the Internal Market (Trade Marks and Designs)* (OHIM), Case T-480/12, Eighth Chamber, Judgment, 11 December 2014  
557

Systematic Index of the Sub-Section  
561

**VII.3 COURT OF JUSTICE**  
563

**VII.3.1**  
LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS  
FROM SELECTED CASE LAW *(Marina Borkoveca, Sébastien Brisard, Guglielmo Cantillo, Keiva Carr, Cristina García Berenguer, Alejandra Victoria García Sánchez, Vicky Hanley-Emilsson, Sven Kaufmann, Giovanna Lanni, Nadia Napoli, Garryfalia A. Nikolakaki, J. Olsson, Anna Oriolo, Cristian Oro Martinez, Cristina Maria Prunaru, Carmine Renzulli, Roberto Soprano, Caterina Tuosto, Anna Vigorito, Chen Wu)*  
565

**VII.3.1.1**  
*Association de médiation sociale v. Union locale des syndicats CGT, Hichem Laboubi, Union départementale CGT des Bouches-du-Rhône, Confédération générale du travail (CGT)*, Case C-176/12, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 15 January 2014  
567
VII.3.1.2 United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland v. European Parliament and Council of the European Union, Case C-270/12, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 22 January 2014 569
VII.3.1.3 Aboubacar Diakité v. Commissaire général aux réfugiés et aux apatrides, Case C-285/12, Fourth Chamber, Judgment, 30 January 2014 572
VII.3.1.4 O. v. Minister voor Immigratie, Integratie en Asiel, and Minister voor Immigratie, Integratie en Asiel v. B., Case C-456/12, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 12 March 2014 575
VII.3.1.5 C.D. v. S.T, Case C-167/12, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 18 March 2014 578
VII.3.1.6 UPC Telekabel Wien GmbH v. Constantin Film Verleih GmbH, Wega Filmproduktionsgesellschaft mbH, Case C-314/12, Fourth Chamber, Judgment, 27 March 2014 581
VII.3.1.7 Digital Rights Ireland Ltd (Case C-293/12) v. Minister for Communications, Marine and Natural Resources, Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform, Commissioner of the Garda Síochána, Ireland, The Attorney General, and Kärntner Landesregierung (Case C-594/12), Michael Seitlinger, Christof Tschohl and Others, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 8 April 2014 584
VII.3.1.8 Google Spain SL, Google Inc. v Agencia Española de Protección de Datos (AEPD), Mario Costeja González, Case C-131/12, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 13 May 2014 587
VII.3.1.9 Jessy Saint Prix v. Secretary of State for Work and Pensions, Case C-507/12, First Chamber, Judgment, 19 June 2014 590
VII.3.1.10 European Parliament v Council of the European Union, Case C-658/11, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 24 June 2014 592
VII.3.1.11 Ålands Vindkraft AB v. Energimyndigheten, Case C-573/12, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 1 July 2014 595
VII.3.1.12 Council of the European Union v. Sophie in ‘t Veld, Case C-350/12 P, First Chamber, Judgment, 3 July 2014 599
VII.3.1.13 Kamino International Logistics BV, Case C-129/13, and Datema Hellman Worldwide Logistics BV, Case C-130/13, v. Stattssecretaris van Financiën, Fifth Chamber, Judgment, 3 July 2014 602
VII.3.1.14 Víctor Manuel Julian Hernández and Others v. Reino de España (Subdelegación del Gobierno de España en Alicante) and Others, Case C-198/13, Fifth Chamber, Judgment, 10 July 2014 605
VII.3.1.15 Apple Inc. v. Deutsches Patent- und Markenamt, Case C-421/13, Third Chamber, Judgment, 10 July 2014 607
VII.3.1.16  Angelo Alberto Torresi and Pierfrancesco Torresi v. Consiglio dell’Ordine degli Avvocati di Macerata, Joined Cases C-58/13 and C-59/13, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 17 July 2014 609

VII.3.1.17  Thi Ly Pham v. Stadt Schweinfurt, Amt für Meldewesen und Statistik, Case C-474/13, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 17 July 2014 612

VII.3.1.18  European Commission v. Council of the European Union, Case C-114/12, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 4 September 2014 614

VII.3.1.19  Air Baltic Corporation AS v. Valsts Robežsardze, Case C-575/12, Fourth Chamber, Judgment, 4 September 2014 616

VII.3.1.20  API—Anonima Petroli Italiana SpA v. Ministero delle Infrastrutture e dei Trasporti, Ministero dello Sviluppo economico and Others, Joined Cases C-184/13 to C-187/13, C-194/13, C-195/13 and C-208/13, Fifth Chamber, Judgment, 4 September 2014 619

VII.3.1.21  Mohamed Ali Ben Alaya v. Bundesrepublik Deutschland, Case C-491/13, Third Chamber, Judgment, 10 September 2014 621

VII.3.1.22  Liivimaa Lihaveis MTÜ v. Eesti-Läti programmi 2007-2013 Seirekomitee, Case C-562/12, Fourth Chamber, Judgment, 17 September 2014 623

VII.3.1.23  Sophie Mukarubega v. Préfet de police, Préfet de la Seine-Saint-Denis, Case C-166/13, Fifth Chamber, Judgment, 5 November 2014 626


VII.3.1.26  A, B and C v. Staatssecretaris van Veiligheid en Justitie, Joined Cases C-148/13, C-149/13 and C-150/13, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 2 December 2014 636

VII.3.1.27  Opinion 2/13 of the Court, Full Court, 18 December 2014 639

VII.3.1.28  Sean Ambrose McCarthy, Helena Patricia McCarthy Rodriguez, Natasha Caley McCarthy Rodriguez v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, Case C-202/13, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 18 December 2014 642

VII.3.1.29  International Stem Cell Corporation v. Comptroller General of Patents, Designs and Trade Marks, Case C-364/13, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 18 December 2014 646

VII.3.1.30  Mohamed M’Bodj v Belgian State, Case C-542/13, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 18 December 2014 648
VII.3.1.31 Centre public d’action sociale d’Ottignies-Louvain-la-Neuve v. Moussa Abdida, Case C-562/13, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 18 December 2014 651

Systematic Index of the Sub-Section 655

VIII. EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS 659

VIII.1 INTRODUCTORY NOTE, Adriana Fillol Mazo & Ana Cristina Gallego Hernández 661

VIII.2 LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS FROM SELECTED CASE LAW (Nuria Arenas-Hidalgo, Tarik Atmane Tlemsani, Simona Fanni, Yolanda Gamarra, Rosa Giles-Carnero, Diana Marín Consarnau, Nadia Napoli, Anna Oriolo, Juan Diego Sánchez Arana, Ángel Tinoco Pastrana, Anna Vigorito, Giuliana Ziccardi Capaldo) 679

VIII.2.1 Case of O’Keeffe v. Ireland, Application No. 35810/09, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 28 January 2014 681

VIII.2.2 Case of Gürtekin and Others v. Cyprus, Ayşe Akay and Others Against Cyprus and Ayşe Eray and Others Against Cyprus Application Nos. 60441/13, 68206/13 and 68667/13, Fourth Section, Decision, 11 March 2014 686

VIII.2.3 Case of Kurić and Others v. Slovenia, Application No. 26828/06, Grand Chamber, Judgment (Just Satisfaction), 12 March 2014 689

VIII.2.4 Case of Cyprus v. Turkey, Application No. 25781/94, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 12 May 2014 692

VIII.2.5 Case of Jones and Others v. The United Kingdom, Application Nos. 34356/06 and 40528/06, Judgment, Fourth Section, 6 June 2014 696

VIII.2.6 Case of Mennesson v. France, Application No. 65192/11, Fifth Section, Judgment, 26 June 2014 698

VIII.2.7 Case of S.A.S. v. France, Application No. 43835/11, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 1 July 2014 700

VIII.2.8 Case of Georgia v. Russia (I), Application No. 13255/07, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 3 July 2014 703

VIII.2.9 Case of Dhahbi v. Italy, Application No. 17120/09, Second Section, Judgment, 8 July 2014 709

VIII.2.10 Case of Hämäläinen v. Finland, Application No. 37359/09, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 16 July 2014 712

VIII.2.11 Case of Švinarenko and Slyadnev v. Russia, Applications Nos. 32541/08 and 43441/08, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 17 July 2014 715

VIII.2.12 Case of Al Nashiri v. Poland, Application No. 28761/11, Former Fourth Section, Judgment, 24 July 2014 718
VIII.2.13  Case of Brincat and Others v. Malta, Applications Nos. 60908/11, 62110/11, 62129/11, 62312/11 and 62338/11, Fifth Section, Judgment, 24 July 2014  721
VIII.2.14  Case of Husayn (Abu Zubaydah) v. Poland, Application No. 7511/13, Former Fourth Section, Judgment, 24 July 2014  723
VIII.2.15  Case of Hassan v. The United Kingdom, Application No. 29750/09, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 16 September 2014  733
VIII.2.16  Case of Velyo Velev v. Bulgaria, Application No. 16032/07, Fourth Section, Judgment, 27 May 2014  696
VIII.2.17  Case of Mocanu and Others v. Romania, Applications Nos. 10865/09, 45886/07 and 3 2431/08, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 17 September 2014  742
VIII.2.18  Case of Hansen v. Norway, Application No. 15319/09, First Section, Judgment, 2 October 2014  746
VIII.2.19  Case of Jeunesse v. The Netherlands, Application No. 12738/10, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 3 October 2014  750
VIII.2.20  Case of Jelić v. Croatia, Application No. 57856/11, First Section, Judgment, 12 June 2014  702
VIII.2.21  Case of Tarakhel v. Switzerland, Application No. 29217/12, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 4 November 2014  758
VIII.2.22  Case of Jaloud v. The Netherlands, Application No. 47708/08, Grand Chamber, Judgment, 20 November 2014  762
VIII.2.23  Case of Ibrahim and Others v. The United Kingdom, Applications Nos. 50541/08, 50571/08, 50573/08 and 40351/09, Fourth Section, Judgment, 16 December 2014  764

Systematic Index of the Sub-Section  767
IX. INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS  771
IX.1  INTRODUCTORY NOTE, Humberto Antonio Sierra-Porto  773
IX.2  LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS FROM SELECTED CASE LAW (Maria José Alvarez, Jacqueline Barrantes Morales, Julie D. Recinos)  779
   IX.2.1  Case of Norín Catrinán et al. v. Argentina, Judgment, 29 May 2014, Series C No. 279  781
   IX.2.2  Case of Rodríguez Vera et al. (the Disappeared from the Palace of Justice) v. Colombia, Judgment, 14 November 2014, Series C No. 287  786
   IX.2.3  Case of Espinoza Gonzáles v. Peru, Judgment, 20 November 2014, Series C No. 289  790

Systematic Index of the Sub-Section  797
X. INTERNATIONAL CENTRE FOR SETTLEMENT OF INVESTMENT DISPUTES

X.1 INTRODUCTORY NOTE, August Reinisch

X.2 LEGAL MAXIMS: SUMMARIES AND EXTRACTS FROM SELECTED CASE LAW (Jane Hofbauer, Lukas Stifter)

X.2.1 Caratube International Oil Company LLP v. Republic of Kazakhstan, ICSID Case No. ARB/08/12, Decision on the Application for Annulment of Caratube International Oil Company LLP, 21 February 2014

X.2.2 Tulip Real Estate Investment and Development Netherlands B.V. v. Republic of Turkey, ICSID Case No. ARB/11/28, Award, 10 March 2014

X.2.3 National Gas S.A.E v. Arab Republic of Egypt, ICSID Case No. ARB/11/7, Award, 3 April 2014

X.2.4 Emmis International Holding, BV, Emmis Radio Operating, BV, MEM Magyar Electronic Media Kereskedelmi és Szolgáltató Kft. v. The Republic of Hungary, ICSID Case No. ARB/12/2, Award, 16 April 2014

X.2.5 David Minnotte and Robert Lewis v. Republic of Poland, ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/10/1, Award, 16 May 2014


X.2.7 Venezuela Holdings, B.V., Mobil Cerro Negro Holding, Ltd., Mobil Venezolana de Petróleos Holdings, Inc., Mobil Cerro Negro, Ltd., and Mobil Venezolana de Petróleos, Inc. v. Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, ICSID Case No. ARB/07/27, Award, 9 October 2014

Systematic Index of the Sub-Section

PART 6: RECENT LINES OF INTERNATIONALIST THOUGHT

The Unapologetic Integration of Ethics: Stakeholder Realignments in the Light of Global Law and Shared Governance Doctrine. Distilling the Essence of Giuliana Ziccardi Capaldo’s Jurisprudential Paradigm-Shifts
Anja Matwijkiw & Bronik Matwijkiw

Recent Practice with Regard to the Optional Clause: An Assessment
John G. Merrills

INDICES

Analytical Index
Table of Cases
Chronological Index of International Instruments, Treaties and Conventions