

THE EXTERNAL DIMENSION OF
EU PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL
LAW AFTER OPINION 1/13

Edited by

Pietro FRANZINA



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

The External Dimension of EU Private International Law after Opinion 1/13
© Pietro Franzina (ed.) 2017

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

ISBN 978-1-78068-437-6
D/2016/7849/165
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	v
PART I. THE INTERNATIONAL PROJECTION OF EU PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW – SOME BASIC ISSUES	1
Opinions 1/13 and 2/13 and EU External Relations Law	
Marise CREMONA	3
1. Introduction: Two Significant Opinions	3
2. Private International Law and EU External Powers.....	5
3. The Role of the Court of Justice	14
4. Conclusion: the Specificity of the EU as an International Actor	19
Between Mutual Trust and Respect for Fundamental Rights – Judicial Cooperation in Civil Matters and the European Convention on Human Rights After Opinion 2/13	
Serena FORLATI	21
1. Introduction	21
2. The ECHR and European Judicial Cooperation in Civil Matters.....	24
3. The Treatment of EU Law by the European Court of Human Rights	27
4. Conclusions.....	38
PART II. OPINION 1/13 AND ITS IMPLICATIONS	41
A Critical Analysis of the Judicial Activism of the Court of Justice of the European Union in Opinion 1/13	
Paul BEAUMONT	43
1. Introduction	43
2. Background to Opinion 1/13.....	44
3. Background to Judicial Activism	45
4. Opinion 1/13 – Admissibility	48
5. Opinion 1/13 – Substance	50
6. Conclusion	60

The Implications of the European Union’s Exclusive Competence with Regard to the Child Abduction Convention	
Giorgio GAJA	63
1. The Basis and Extent of the Exclusive Competence of the EU Concerning International Child Abduction	63
2. The Scope of the Exclusive Competence of the EU as Regards Actions Relating to the Child Abduction Convention	66
3. The Procedure for Exercising the Competence of the EU as Regards the Child Abduction Convention.....	66
4. Does the Child Abduction Convention Bind the EU?	67
5. The Role of the Court of Justice in the Interpretation of the Child Abduction Convention	69
Consequences of Opinion 1/13 on the Acceptance in the EU of Accessions to the Hague Child Abduction Convention	
Karen VANDEKERCKHOVE	71
1. Introduction	71
2. Acceptance of Accessions to the 1980 Hague Child Abduction Convention – The Way Forward.....	73
3. Conclusion.....	75
International Agreements on Private International Law Matters Not Covered by EU Legislation – Which Test Should Be Adopted to Assess the Competence of the EU?	
Chiara E. TUO	77
1. The Position of The ECJ on the External Competence of the EU in the Area of Private International Law.....	77
2. The ‘Effect on EU Law Test’ as Opposed to the ‘Necessity Test’ of Opinion 1/76.....	84
3. The EU Legal Framework on Free Movement Of Citizens as the Yardstick Against Which the Exclusive External Competence in Private International Law Matters Should Be Assessed.....	88
4. From Theory to Practice: the ‘Effect on EU Law Test’ Applied to the Intercountry Adoption Convention	91

PART III.	
THE CHANGING FEATURES OF EU EXTERNAL RELATIONS IN THE AREA OF PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW	99
EU External Relations and Private International Law: Multilateralism, Plurilateralism, Bilateralism, or Unilateralism?	
Alex MILLS.....	101
1. Introduction	101
2. Multilateralism	104
3. Plurilateralism or Bilateralism	107
4. Unilateralism	110
5. Conclusions.....	115
EU Cooperation in Civil Matters and Multilevel Unification of Private International Law: Some Remarks	
Alessandra ZANOBETTI.....	117
1. The Multilevel Unification of Private International Law.....	117
2. The Europeanisation of Private International Law and Its Impact on the Adoption of Uniform Rules at Regional and Universal Level	118
3. The Interaction Between EU Private International Law and Other Private International Law Instruments.....	123
4. EU Private International Law as a Tool for the Establishment of an Area of Freedom, Security And Justice.....	124
5. EU and Uniform Instruments in the Field of International Trade ...	127
6. Perspectives on the Unification of Private International Law	129
The Lugano Model – Cooperative Enhancement Over Enhanced Cooperation	
Chris THOMALE	131
1. Introduction	131
2. The Lugano Convention: Cooperative Enhancement Towards an Integrated European Economic Area.....	133
3. Differentiated Integration in Europe: The Lugano Convention as a Multilateral International Treaty with a Qualified Connection to EU Law	139
4. Lugano Outdated: Why Lugano in Its <i>Status Quo</i> Is No Viable Model of European or Global Integration.....	141
5. Lugano Reloaded: Further Potential in Service of Documents and Taking of Evidence	145
Regulations (EC) Nos 662/2009 and 664/2009: Can Exclusivity Be Successfully Reconciled with Flexibility?	
Jan-Jaap KUIPERS.....	149
1. Introduction	149
2. Evolving Union Competences in Private International Law	151

3. The External Dimension of the EU Private International Law Regulations	153
4. The Regulations	167
5. Conclusion	179

PART IV.

EU LEGISLATION ON PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW AND EXTRA-EUROPEAN SITUATIONS	181
---	-----

The Interplay of EU Legislation and International Developments in Private International Law

Pietro FRANZINA	183
1. The Virtual Global Reach of EU Legislation on Private International Law	183
2. The Articulation of EU Legislation and International Developments: A Matter of Convergence, Combination and Confrontation.....	190
3. Convergence	192
4. Combination.....	199
5. Confrontation	204
6. Concluding Remarks.....	209

Jurisdiction Under the EU Succession Regulation and Relationships with Third Countries

Fabrizio MARONGIU BUONAIUTI	211
1. The Limited <i>Erga Omnes</i> Approach Underlying the Succession Regulation's Rules On Jurisdiction	211
2. Rules Addressing Issues of Coordination with Third-Country Courts.....	220
3. The Unilateral Coordination with the Jurisdiction of Third-Country Courts Pursued by Article 12(1) of the Regulation	225
4. Concluding Remarks.....	226