

Susanna Villani

**THE CONCEPT OF  
SOLIDARITY  
WITHIN EU DISASTER  
RESPONSE LAW**

A legal assessment

Bononia  
University Press



alphabet **13**



Susanna Villani

**THE CONCEPT OF  
SOLIDARITY  
WITHIN EU DISASTER  
RESPONSE LAW**

A legal assessment

Bononia  
University Press

Il volume è tratto dalla tesi di dottorato *The concept of solidarity within EU disaster response law: a legal assessment*. Alma Mater Studiorum - Università di Bologna, Dottorato di ricerca in Diritto europeo, ciclo XXX, depositata in AMSDottorato - Institutional Theses Repository (<http://amsdottorato.unibo.it/>)



ALMA MATER STUDIORUM  
UNIVERSITÀ DI BOLOGNA

Il testo è stato sottoposto a peer review / This text has been peer reviewed

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution (CC) BY-NC-SA 4.0

This license allows you to reproduce, share and adapt the work, in whole or in part, for non-commercial purposes only, providing attribution is made to the authors (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work). Attribution should include the following information:

Susanna Villani, *The concept of solidarity within EU disaster response law. A legal assessment*, Bologna: Bononia University Press, 2021

Quest'opera è pubblicata sotto licenza Creative Commons (CC) BY-NC-SA 4.0

Questa licenza consente di riprodurre, condividere e adattare l'opera, in tutto o in parte, esclusivamente per scopi di tipo non commerciale, riconoscendo una menzione di paternità adeguata (non con modalità tali da suggerire che il licenziante avalli l'utilizzo dell'opera).

La menzione dovrà includere le seguenti informazioni:

Susanna Villani, *The concept of solidarity within EU disaster response law. A legal assessment*, Bologna: Bononia University Press, 2021

Bononia University Press  
Via Ugo Foscolo 7  
40124 Bologna  
tel. (+39) 051 232882  
fax (+39) 051 221019  
[www.buponline.com](http://www.buponline.com)

ISSN 2724-0290  
ISBN 978-88-6923-823-9  
ISBN online 978-88-6923-824-6

Progetto grafico e impaginazione: Design People (Bologna)  
Prima edizione: giugno 2021

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   |    |
|---|----|
| <b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b>  | 9  |
| <b>PREFACE</b>  | 11 |
| <i>Paraskevi Michou</i>   |    |
| CHAPTER I   |    |
| <b>PREMISES, OBJECT, AND INVESTIGATION PLAN</b>   | 15 |
| <b>1. Introduction</b>  | 15 |
| <b>2. Theoretical premises of investigation</b>   | 20 |
| 2.1 Clarifications concerning the term ‘disaster’   | 20 |
| 2.2 The notion of ‘solidarity’: what legal value under international law?   | 26 |
| <b>3. State of the art of IDRL under the lens of solidarity</b>   | 34 |
| 3.1 States’ responsibilities to respond to disasters: between sovereignty and solidarity                            | 34 |
| <i>a) Duties and responsibilities of the affected State</i>   | 36 |
| <i>b) Providing assistance as the States’ right</i>   | 38 |
| <i>c) A human rights-based approach for remodelling State sovereignty</i>   | 40 |
| 3.2 The work of the ILC on the “Protection of Persons in the Event of Disasters”: in search of duties of solidarity | 46 |
| 3.2.1 <i>Content of the Draft Articles as adopted by the ILC on second reading</i>                                  | 47 |
| 3.2.2 <i>A critical assessment of the ILC Draft Articles</i>  | 53 |
| 3.3 Regional cooperation in responding to disasters: a stairway to solidarity?                                      | 58 |
| <i>a) Disaster response in the Americas</i>   | 59 |
| <i>b) Disaster response in Asia</i>   | 61 |
| <i>c) Disaster response in the Pacific region</i>   | 63 |
| <i>d) Disaster response in the African continent</i>  | 65 |
| <i>e) Disaster response in the Middle East</i>  | 66 |
| <i>f) Disaster response in Europe and the NATO cooperation</i>  | 67 |
| <i>g) General considerations</i>  | 69 |
| <b>4. Aims and research plan</b>  | 69 |

CHAPTER II

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>THE MULTIFACETED CONCEPT OF SOLIDARITY WITHIN THE EU LEGAL ORDER</b>                   | 75  |
| <b>1. Mainstreaming solidarity within EU law: an introduction</b>                         | 75  |
| <b>2. Evolution of the concept of solidarity within the EU legal order</b>                | 77  |
| 2.1 Trends in early EU case-law   | 81  |
| 2.2 After the Lisbon revision   | 85  |
| 2.2.1 <i>Solidarity in practice: some references to the sectors wherein it intervenes</i> | 87  |
| 2.2.2 <i>In search of the legal content of solidarity</i>                                 | 91  |
| a) <i>Solidarity as a value of the European Union construction</i>                        | 91  |
| b) <i>Solidarity as an objective of the EU integration process</i>                        | 93  |
| c) <i>Solidarity as a principle of the EU legal order</i>                                 | 95  |
| d) <i>The interplay between solidarity and loyalty within the EU legal order</i>          | 104 |
| <b>3. Solidarity in the event of a disaster within EU law: starting premises</b>          | 109 |
| 3.1 The multi-layered nature of the EU legal instruments for responding to disasters      | 111 |

CHAPTER III

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>TRADITIONAL FORMS OF SOLIDARITY: EU INSTRUMENTS OF FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO COPE WITH DISASTERS</b>                                    | 115 |
| <b>1. Financial solidarity in case of a disaster</b>   | 115 |
| <b>2. Direct financial instruments of solidarity</b>   | 116 |
| 2.1 The EU Solidarity Fund as an instrument for disaster recovery  | 116 |
| 2.1.1 <i>The EU Solidarity Fund: features and early improvement attempts</i>   | 117 |
| 2.1.2 <i>Regulation (EU) 661/2014 and later amendments: a step forward in granting financial assistance under the EU Solidarity Fund</i> | 119 |
| 2.2 The EU Emergency Support Instrument: a new tool for internal emergencies?  | 123 |
| 2.2.1 <i>Filling the gap with the international solidarity provided by the Humanitarian Aid Instrument</i>                               | 123 |
| 2.2.2 <i>When Member States need immediate assistance: main legal characters of the EU Emergency Support Instrument</i>                  | 128 |
| 2.2.3 <i>Critical points and future prospects of the EU Emergency Support Instrument</i>   | 131 |
| <b>3. Derogation regimes in times of emergency as an expression of solidarity</b>  | 137 |
| 3.1 Derogations to the EU' State aid regime in the event of a disaster   | 137 |
| 3.1.1 <i>Negative elements affecting solidarity in the field of State aid regime</i>   | 139 |
| 3.2 Solidarity and national budget balance in the event of a disaster: some brief reflections  | 143 |
| <b>4. Some concluding remarks on financial instruments of assistance in the event of a disaster</b>                                      | 146 |
| 4.1 Solidarity and conditionality: two reconcilable concepts?  | 147 |

CHAPTER IV

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>THE EU CIVIL PROTECTION MECHANISM: IN-KIND ASSISTANCE TO COPE WITH DISASTERS</b>   | <b>153</b> |
| 1. The Union as a catalyst of in-kind assistance: an introduction   | 153        |
| 2. The long road towards the creation of the EU Civil Protection Mechanism  | 154        |
| 2.1 The normative framework of civil protection: first steps within the European Economic Community                               | 154        |
| 2.2 The normative framework of civil protection: from Maastricht to the establishment of the Community Civil Protection Mechanism | 157        |
| 2.2.1 <i>The Community Civil Protection Action Programme</i>  | 160        |
| 2.2.2 <i>The establishment of a Community Civil Protection Mechanism</i>  | 161        |
| 2.3 From the Community Civil Protection Mechanism to the entry into force of the Lisbon Treaty                                    | 164        |
| 2.3.1 <i>The Barnier Report: for a European civil protection force</i>  | 165        |
| 2.3.2 <i>Developments after the Barnier report</i>  | 167        |
| 3. The Lisbon Treaty and the Union Civil Protection Mechanism   | 172        |
| 3.1 The new competence in the field of civil protection   | 172        |
| 3.2 The adoption of a new legislative act on a Union Civil Protection Mechanism   | 175        |
| 3.3 Decision 1313/2013: old and new elements framing the Union Civil Protection Mechanism   | 178        |
| 3.4 Decision (EU) 2019/420: features of the new rescEU system   | 182        |
| 3.5 The activation of the UCPM <i>vis-à-vis</i> the COVID-19 pandemic and related initiatives                                     | 188        |
| 4. The Union Civil Protection Mechanism: right or obligation to solidarity?   | 191        |

CHAPTER V

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>THE 'SOLIDARITY CLAUSE': LEGAL DUTIES AND INTERACTION WITH THE EU INSTRUMENTS FOR DISASTER RESPONSE</b> | <b>199</b> |
| 1. The solidarity clause: content and legal implications   | 200        |
| 1.1 The path towards the inclusion of a 'solidarity clause' within the Treaties                            | 200        |
| 1.2 The implementation of the solidarity clause by the Union: Council Decision 2014/415/EU                 |            |
| a) <i>Scope of application ratione materiae and ratione temporis of the solidarity clause</i>              | 205        |
| b) <i>Scope of application ratione loci of the solidarity clause</i>                                       | 209        |
| c) <i>Instruments of application of the solidarity clause</i>  | 211        |
| 1.3 The solidarity clause: implications for Member States  | 214        |
| a) <i>Member States shall jointly act with the Union</i>   | 214        |
| b) <i>Member States shall assist the affected State</i>  | 216        |
| c) <i>Member States shall coordinate between themselves</i>  | 218        |



2. The Union shall mobilise all the instruments at its disposal: the interplay between the solidarity clause and the instruments of disaster response 219

2.1 The interplay between the solidarity clause and the Union Civil Protection Mechanism 220

2.2 The solidarity clause and the EU Emergency Support Instrument 222

2.3 The solidarity clause and the EU Solidarity Fund: the prospect of an obligation? 224

3. Evaluating the real legal value and the banding nature of the solidarity clause 225

**CONCLUSIONS** 231

1. Solidarity within the EU legal order: a play of lights and shadows 231

1.1. The bright side of solidarity in EU disaster response law: the establishment of mechanisms of solidarity 234

1.2 The dark side of solidarity in EU disaster response law: the lack of clear duties of solidarity 236

1.3 Reading the dark side and the bright side for a new paradigm of solidarity 239

2. A change of paradigm needs a change of pace in the EU integration process 242

**BIBLIOGRAPHY** 245