

Diego Mauri

entorel ottollor entone entonio

Autonomous Weapons Systems and the Protection of the Human Person An International Law Analysis

10000 01101110 110101 01101101 0 01001000 01110101 011010 01100001 101101 011000001 010111 01101 01101 01100001 0100 ELGAR INTERNATIONAL LAW AND TECHNOLOGY

0100100 0110101 0110101 0100001 0110110

01001000 0110101 011010 00010010

01101110

01001000 01110101 0110101 01100001

Autonomous Weapons Systems and the Protection of the Human Person

ELGAR INTERNATIONAL LAW AND TECHNOLOGY

Series Editors: Nicholas Tsagourias, *Professor of International Law* and Russell Buchan, *Senior Lecturer in International Law, University of Sheffield, UK*

Editorial Board: Duncan Hollis, *Temple University, USA*, Ashley Deeks, *University of Virginia, USA*, Marco Roscini, *University of Westminster, UK*, Zhixiong Huang, *Wuhan University, China*, Theodore Christakis, *University of Grenoble, France,* Karine Bannelier, *University of Grenoble, France,* Uti Korhonen, *Turku University, Finland,* and Rain Liivoja, *University of Queensland, Australia*

The aim of the series is to act as a platform to examine the implications of technology such as IT, cyber technology, autonomy, robotics, nano-technology, space technology, geo-engineering, sea-bed technology, and Artificial Intelligence on the practice and theory of international law and to address the challenges that arise. The development of technology and its use across different areas of human and state activity has raised questions about the scope, content, and reach of international law and of existing regulatory regimes as well as proposals for their reinterpretation and readjustment or for the development of new rules and regulatory regimes. This book series will capture the challenges and opportunities that arise from the intersection of technology with different areas of international law such as legal theory, human rights, humanitarian law, international criminal law, security, trade law, environmental law, international responsibility, dispute settlement and many more. It will also capture the challenges that arise when international law intersects with other legal regimes such as national law or regional law such as EU law in regulating technology. The aim of the series is to produce innovative, scholarly, and cross-disciplinary publications to inform scholars and practitioners and to promote knowledge.

Autonomous Weapons Systems and the Protection of the Human Person

An International Law Analysis

Diego Mauri

Post-Doc Researcher in International Law, Department of Legal Sciences, University of Florence, Italy

ELGAR INTERNATIONAL LAW AND TECHNOLOGY



Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

Property of Edward Elgar Publishing Ltd. Unauthorised copying or distribution is prohibited.

© Diego Mauri 2022

Cover image: © Kathryn Brimble combe-Fox, *Manhunting*, 2017, gouache on paper, 56×75 cm.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by Edward Elgar Publishing Limited The Lypiatts 15 Lansdown Road Cheltenham Glos GL50 2JA UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc. William Pratt House 9 Dewey Court Northampton Massachusetts 01060 USA

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Control Number: 2022932894

This book is available electronically in the **Elgar**online Law subject collection http://dx.doi.org/10.4337/9781802207675

ISBN 978 1 80220 766 8 (cased) ISBN 978 1 80220 767 5 (eBook)

Contents

Foreword by Mary Ellen O'Connell Acknowledgments List of abbreviations		vi vii ix
1	Introduction: Autonomous Weapons Systems and the Protection of the Human Person	1
2	Sketching the debate	14
3	Autonomous weapons systems under international human rights law	67
4	Autonomous weapons systems under international humanitarian law	118
5	Autonomous weapons systems and the 'accountability gap' conundrum	176
6	Building the bridge to the future	235
Bibliography Index		260 284

Foreword

Weapons represent one of the great paradoxes of humanity. Human beings constantly research and develop new weapons—new ways of killing with increased lethality, ease of use, greater precision, and capabilities of all kinds. At the same time, we constantly contemplate the morality of using weapons. Moral assessment leads to efforts at legal regulation, including banning specific weapons. The paradox has been on full display for a decade and a half regarding fully autonomous robotic weapons and the effort to ban or strictly limit their use.

This book is the rare study of all three aspects of the weapons paradox as regards autonomous weapons. It is a fully integrated account of what we need to know in order to understand the current debate about using autonomous weapons with some regulation or banning them altogether. The author expertly explains the complex new technological research involved in autonomous weapons. These are weapons that remove the need for a human responsibility for the decision to take the life of another person. He has appropriately chosen human rights as the standard against which to assess the morality of this recent development in weapons technology. He is then able to consider issues such as whether to ban or regulate, and how to do so. The discussion is engaging, allowing readers to come to their own, informed conclusions.

I have had the privilege of discussing the law and morality of high-tech weapons with Diego Mauri since his research visit to the University of Notre Dame in 2018. I found him to be one of the rare human beings with the ability to write comprehensively on one of the greatest challenges to the law and morality of arms control. He came with a wealth of knowledge, which he generously shared, as well as experience in the Holy See's delegation to the principal negotiations concerned with regulating autonomous weapons. He came also with a determined purpose to deepen his knowledge and understanding. This book is a testament to his success and an important contribution to law and ethics.

Mary Ellen O'Connell Robert and Marion Short Professor of Law University of Notre Dame, USA

Acknowledgments

This book is the result of a long-running journey that would not have been possible without the travelling companions I was undeservedly lucky enough to have.

Ideally, this journey started during my internship at the Permanent Mission of the Holy See at the United Nations in Geneva in summer 2015: it was then that, accidentally, I came across some paperwork on a subject that was totally unknown to me, 'Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems' (LAWS). That curious assonance with the English term for the rules of law—paradoxical for a weapons system which, on first impression, threatened to clash head-on with every moral and legal rule—was too precise to be left aside. I later had the unique privilege to join, first, the Holy See's Delegation to the Meeting of Experts and, later, the Group of Governmental Experts, which gave me access not only to a wealth of technical documents and insights into the diplomatic arena, but also—and above all—to a network of faces and expertise that I would rarely meet outside. This is why I am grateful primarily to the Mission's personnel, from Msgr Tomasi and Msgr Jurkovič (who served as Permanent Representatives during my stays) to all colleagues and friends I have had the chance to meet during these years.

My sincerest and affectionate thanks go to my mentor, Pasquale De Sena, who fatherly supported me not only in structuring this book, but also in taking my first steps in the academia. I really lack the words to properly thank Micaela Frulli, with whom I have the honour to work in Florence: her encouraging attentions and enthusiastic spurs, especially at the beginning of this adventure, have been an unexpected gift for me. I was then lucky enough to dock, for a few months, at the University of Notre Dame (US), where I met Mary Ellen O'Connell-her strong inclination towards the need to combine law and morality was a real source of inspiration for my reflections-and at the European Centre for Constitutional and Human Rights (ECCHR) in Berlin, where I worked closely with Chantal Meloni on related projects. My research also benefited from several presentations and discussions, for which I am grateful to Andrea Saccucci, Luisa Vierucci, Deborah Russo, Maria Chiara Vitucci, Gabriele Della Morte, Giulio Bartolini, Alessandra Gianelli and Chiara Venturini. Lastly, I have to dedicate a special mention to the personnel of the Istituto di Scienze Militari Aeronautiche of the Italian Air Force and, in particular, to Colonel Andrea Rossi: they have always been available to meet me during the drafting process and share their views on the military implications of autonomous weapons systems (AWS).

Those who agreed to dedicate their time and energy to my work are many and now that I think about it, I feel I have to apologize. The first is, beyond doubt, Daniele Amoroso, with whom I have consumed hours (especially during vacation days) discussing AWS: without his brilliant intuitions and witty critiques, my modest reflections on this topic would have been trivial. Laura Magi and Olivia Lopes Pegna accepted to read and review portions of the book, giving me thoughtful suggestions on what to insert and change. Martina Buscemi's sharp eyesight was indispensable for strengthening the structure; the same goes for Marco Roscini, who helped me with the book project. Lorenzo Acconciamessa and Francesca Tammone—whom I regard as friends even before colleagues—read previous versions of the book and shared their stimulating views with me. Finally, Edward Elgar's publishing team (Caroline Cornish, Amber Watts and Ben Booth in particular) provided me with superb and prompt assistance through the editorial process.

As an antidote to solitude characterizing works such as writing a monograph, doctors recommend companionship by trustworthy and friendly faces. I listened to them. Thus, the number of people who have contributed to make my heavy days lighter is so great that I cannot name names here. But this relieves me, because I know from the affection that binds us that, when they read these lines, they will immediately understand I am referring to them. I am thankful beyond words for what their support and friendship means to me. To Gloria, my love, and to my parents and family goes one last, heart-felt thank you for being my compass through this journey.