



Routledge Research in EU Law

EU LAW ENFORCEMENT THE EVOLUTION OF SANCTIONING POWERS

Edited by

Stefano Montaldo, Francesco Costamagna, Alberto Miglio



G. Giappichelli Editore



EU Law Enforcement
The Evolution of Sanctioning Powers

Routledge Research in EU Law

Available titles in this series include:

The Evolving EU Counter-terrorism Legal Framework

Maria O'Neill

The Early Warning System for the Principle of Subsidiarity

Constitutional Theory and Empirical Reality

Philipp Kiiver

The European Constitution, Welfare States and Democracy

The Four Freedoms vs. National Administrative Discretion

Christoffer C. Eriksen

New Governance and the European Strategy for Employment

Samantha Velluti

Human Rights and Minority Rights in the European Union

Kirsten Shoraka

Centralized Enforcement, Legitimacy and Good Governance in the EU

Melanie Smith

EU External Relations and Systems of Governance

The CFSP, Euro-Mediterranean Partnership and migration

Paul James Cardwell

The EU Social Market Economy and the Law

Theoretical Perspectives and Practical Challenges for the EU

Delia Ferri and Fulvio Cortese

Gender and the Court of Justice of the EU

Jessica Guth and Sanna Elfving

The EU and the Proliferation of Integration Principles under the Lisbon Treaty

Francesca Ippolito, Maria Eugenia Bartoloni, Massimo Condinanzi

Migration Law and the Externalization of Border Controls

European State Responsibility

Anna Liguori

Member States Interests and European Union Law

Revisiting the Foundations of Member State Obligations

Marton Varju

<https://www.routledge.com/Routledge-Research-in-EU-Law/book-series/ROUTEULAW>

Stefano Montaldo, Francesco Costamagna, Alberto Miglio

EU Law Enforcement The Evolution of Sanctioning Powers

 **Routledge**
Taylor & Francis Group
LONDON AND NEW YORK



G. Giappichelli Editore

First published 2020
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

and by G. Giappichelli Editore
Via Po 21, Torino – Italia

© 2020 Stefano Montaldo, Francesco Costamagna, Alberto Miglio

The right of Stefano Montaldo, Francesco Costamagna, Alberto Miglio to be identified as authors of this work has been asserted by them in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book has been requested

ISBN: 978-88-921-3454-6 (hbk-G. Giappichelli Editore)
ISBN: 978-0-367-18640-1 (hbk-Routledge)
ISBN: 978-0-429-19781-9 (ebk-Routledge)

Typeset in Simoncini Garamond
by G. Giappichelli Editore, Turin, Italy

The manuscript has been subjected to the double blind peer review process prior to publication.

The publication of this book was funded by Fondazione Compagnia di San Paolo, in the framework of the research project of the University of Turin “Offenders’ Rehabilitation in the European Union”, coordinated by Prof. Stefano Montaldo.



CONTENTS

page

1. Introduction

Stefano Montaldo, Francesco Costamagna, Alberto Miglio 1

2. EU (Shared) Law Enforcement: Who Does What and How?

Miroslava Scholten 7

- 2.1. Introduction 7
- 2.2. Defining EU law enforcement and its types 9
- 2.3. EU (shared) law enforcement in different policy areas 11
- 2.4. EU enforcement and sanctions 19
- 2.5. Conclusion 22

3. New Actors on the Stage: The Emerging Role of EU Agencies in Exercising Sanctioning Powers

Jacopo Alberti 25

- 3.1. Introduction 26
- 3.2. EU agencies: a brief overview 27
 - 3.2.1. EU agencies: what's in a name? Some methodological caveats for assessing the bodies under scrutiny... 27
 - 3.2.2. ... and some key-features particularly relevant for understanding their limits and potentialities in issuing sanctions 28
- 3.3. The agencies' contribution to EU law enforcement. A theoretical perspective 31
 - 3.3.1. EU agencies as a tool to force the 'sanction conundrum' of the EU? 31
 - 3.3.2. EU agencies as ever-changing creators of enforcement practices 33
- 3.4. An analytical taxonomy of EU agencies' direct or indirect sanctioning powers 35
 - 3.4.1. Collection and spread of information and best practices among national administrations 35
 - 3.4.2. Monitoring activities and inspections that might bring to sanction issued by national or EU authorities 36
 - 3.4.3. Power to propose to the Commission to impose fees 37

	<i>page</i>
3.4.4. Assistance in the enforcement of EU law (a silent erosion of the Commission's infringement powers?)	38
3.4.5. Power to impose fees (and the not-always-unlimited jurisdiction of the Court of Justice of the EU)	41
3.5. EU agencies' contribution to the exercise of sanctioning power: current and future challenges	44
 4. From Sanctions to Prevention, and Now Back to Sanctions? Article 7 TEU and the Protection of the EU Founding Values	
<i>Matteo Bonelli</i>	47
4.1. Introduction	48
4.2. Article 7 TEU: an overview of the system	49
4.2.1. Article 7(1): clear risk of a serious breach	50
4.2.2. Article 7(2): serious and persistent breach	50
4.2.3. Article 7(3) and (4): sanctions	51
4.2.4. Article 7: concluding thoughts	54
4.3. From sanctions to prevention...	54
4.3.1. The origins of the procedure: a sanctions regime	55
4.3.2. The Haider case: moving towards prevention	57
4.3.3. The Commission's Rule of Law Framework: doubling down on prevention	58
4.3.4. The Council Rule of Law Dialogue: a 'culture' of prevention?	60
4.4. ...and now back to sanctions?	61
4.4.1. The new centrality of Article 7	62
4.4.2. New tools: rule of law conditionality	63
4.4.3. Reviving 'old' tools: the infringement procedure	65
4.5. Concluding remarks and possible future developments	66
 5. Infringement Procedures and Sanctions under Article 260 TFEU: Evolution, Limits and Future Prospects	
<i>Luca Prete</i>	71
5.1. Introduction	71
5.2. Evolution	73
5.2.1. Article 260(2) TFEU: <i>nihil sub sole novum</i> ?	74
5.2.2. Article 260(3) TFEU: (some) clarity at last	75
5.2.2.1. The nature and purpose of the provision	76
5.2.2.2. The scope of the provision	78
5.2.2.3. The <i>an</i> and <i>quantum</i> of the sanctions	80
5.2.3. Article 279 TFEU: penalty payments as <i>interim</i> measures	81
5.2.3.1. The Court's order of 20 November 2017	82
5.2.3.2. Did the Court see the full picture?	83
5.2.3.3. A more thoughtful reflection	85
5.3. Limits and future prospects	86

6. Fundamental Rights as Constraints to the Power of the European Union to Impose Sanctions

<i>Nicole Lazzerini</i>	93
6.1. Introduction: the twofold relationship between fundamental rights and the power of the Union to impose sanctions	94
6.2. The duty of the Union to respect fundamental rights and its implications on the power to sanction	97
6.3. Substantive and procedural fundamental rights constraints in the sanctioning cycle: a mapping exercise	102
6.3.1. “Shaping” sanctions	102
6.3.2. Proceedings that may lead to the imposition of sanctions and related investigatory activities	105
6.3.3. Judicial review of sanctions	108
6.4. Concluding remarks	113

7. EU Sanctioning Power and the Principle of Proportionality

<i>Stefano Montaldo</i>	115
7.1. Introduction: proportionality and sanctions in EU law	115
7.2. EU sanctions and proportionality: the normative layer	117
7.2.1. EU direct sanctions	117
7.2.2. EU indirect sanctions: the adoption of common standards concerning the duty incumbent upon the Member States to sanction breaches of Union law	121
7.3. The judicial review of EU direct and indirect sanctions: the role of the Court of Justice	125
7.3.1. The judicial review of national measures: derogations from EU law	125
7.3.2. The judicial review of national measures: implementation of EU law	128
7.3.3. The judicial review of EU sanctions	131
7.4. Conclusions	136

8. Sanctions in the EMU Economic Pillar

<i>Francesco Costamagna, Alberto Miglio</i>	139
8.1. Introduction	139
8.2. The structure of the EMU and the rationale for sanctions	140
8.3. “Hard” sanctioning powers in the EMU economic pillar	144
8.3.1. Sanctions under the Stability and Growth Pact	144
8.3.2. The Macroeconomic Imbalances Procedure	146
8.4. The limited application of sanctions: reasons and alternatives	148
8.4.1. Elements of flexibility in the sanctioning machinery	148
8.4.2. Enforcement by the market	151
8.4.3. Conditionality	153

	<i>page</i>
8.5. Towards quasi-automatic enforcement? Reverse qualified majority voting	156
8.6. Conclusion	158
 9. The Sanctioning Power of the ECB: From One to Several Regimes	
<i>Frédéric Allemand</i>	161
9.1. Introduction	161
9.2. The distinct philosophy of the ECB's monetary and prudential tasks	163
9.2.1. Monetary policy: favouring the market approach	163
9.2.2. Prudential policy: improving the regulatory approach	165
9.3. The duality and complexity of the two legal regimes	169
9.3.1. General power to sanction	170
9.3.2. The specific sanctioning power of the ECB in the prudential supervision area	173
9.4. The convergence of sanctioning procedures	178
9.4.1. Initiation and investigation phase	178
9.4.2. The decision on sanction and its administrative review	181
9.5. Concluding remarks	184
 10. Restrictive Measures as Tools of EU Foreign and Security Policy: Promoting EU values, from Antiterrorism to Country Sanctions	
<i>Charlotte Beaucillon</i>	187
10.1. Introduction	188
10.2. Normative synergies: promoting EU values through international sanctions	190
10.2.1. The two faces of Janus: a double qualification in EU and international law	190
10.2.2. EU restrictive measures as international sanctions	193
10.2.3. The double purpose of EU restrictive measures: respect for international law and EU values	195
10.3. The mechanics of normative exportation: linking EU values to international law	197
10.3.1. EU restrictive measures implementing UNSC counter-terrorism resolutions: exporting human rights to the international collective security system through the EU member States. – i. Member states obligations under EU and UN law: a combined reading. – ii. The coordination of the Union and the UN by their common Member States.	197
10.3.2. EU restrictive measures imposing autonomous sanctions in reaction to a treaty breach: exporting human rights, democracy and the rule of law to third-country partners	202
10.3.3. EU restrictive measures imposing autonomous sanctions in reaction to violations of customary international law: the case of massive human rights violations	207
10.4. Conclusions	212

11. Entering the Buffer Zone between Legality and Illegality: EU Autonomous Sanctions under International Law

<i>Andrea Spagnolo</i>	215
11.1. Introduction: research question and structure of the chapter	215
11.2. Identifying the buffer zone in the law of sanctions in international law	216
11.3. An introduction to EU restrictive measures (sanctions)	220
11.4. Exploring the buffer zone	226
11.5. EU restrictive measures as third-party countermeasures adopted by non-injured entities	232
11.6. Concluding remarks	239

12. Sanctions in EU Competition Law: Ensuring Deterrence within the Decentralised Enforcement System of Articles 101 and 102 TFEU

<i>Luca Calzolari</i>	241
12.1. Preliminary remarks	241
12.2. The optimal level of antitrust sanctions: a quest for the soul of competition policy	242
12.3. Sanctioning powers within the context of the “modernized” system of enforcement of Articles 101 and 102 TFEU	245
12.4. The margin of discretion conferred to the Commission (and NCAs): the standard of judicial review in competition cases	249
12.5. Setting sanctions in practice: the 2006 Fining Guidelines	252
12.6. The limited role played by intent and imputability in the antitrust realm	257
12.7. Negotiated remedies <i>vis-à-vis</i> individual sanctions: diverging trends?	261

13. Protecting the Environment through Union Sanctions: The Many Facets of the Enforcement of EU Environmental Law

<i>Francesco Munari</i>	267
13.1. Introduction	268
13.2. The EU environmental policy and rules as crafted at primary law level: converging principles to secure compliance	269
13.3. The multi-faceted scenario of enforcement of EU environmental law: enforcement on Member States and sanctions for non-fulfilment of the obligation to implement EU environmental directives	271
13.4. Interim measures and sanctions to protect the environment	275
13.5. Damages actions by individuals against Member States for breach of EU environmental law?	276
13.6. Enforcement on individuals: Directive 2004/35/EC on environmental liability (and related sanctions under Member States’ national laws)	277
13.7. The duty of Member States to enforce effective, proportionate and dissuasive penalties in case of an infringement of EU environmental law as a general principle of EU law: detailed sanctions for breaches of the ETS regime and relevant CJEU case-law	281

	<i>page</i>
13.8. Directive 2008/99/EC on the protection of the environment through criminal law: a point of arrival for sanctions in EU sectoral law or rules still to be fine-tuned?	285
13.9. Concluding remarks	288
 14. EU Sanctioning Powers and Data Protection: New Tools for Ensuring the Effectiveness of the GDPR in the Spirit of Cooperative Federalism	
<i>Paul De Hert</i>	291
14.1. Introduction: the enforcement of EU data protection relies on a criminal justice model, a civil justice model, and an enforcement agency model	292
14.2. EU secondary laws on data protection	293
14.3. EU primary law provisions on data protection and the imperative to improve EU data protection	296
14.4. Independent and effective data protection authorities (DPAs) and the GDPR	300
14.5. Responsibilities, tasks and powers of DPAs (Articles 57-58-59 GDPR)	304
14.6. European and trans-border tasks and cooperation between DPAs (one-stop-shop and EDPB)	305
14.7. Remedies	308
14.8. Overview of recent sanctioning practices	310
14.9. Creating supervisory convergence without creating new EU institutions (reflection 1)	312
14.10. The administrative enforcement fray and defence rights (reflection 2)	314
14.11. The role of criminal law in EU data protection law (reflection 3)	320
14.12. Conclusion: boost in administrative enforcement partly on cooperative federalist arrangements with open questions about how the GDPR will be put into practice	323
 <i>Index</i>	 325