

Sufficient Gravity before the International Criminal Court

Property of Edward Elgar Publishing Ltd. Unauthorised copying or distribution is prohibited.

ELGAR INTERNATIONAL LAW

Series Editor: Jacob Katz Cogan, *University of Cincinnati, USA*

Editorial Board: Fausto Pocar, *University of Milan, Italy*, Christian Tams, *University of Glasgow, UK*, Nigel White, *University of Nottingham, UK*, Hilary Charlesworth, *University of Melbourne, Australia* and Judge, *International Court of Justice*, Helmut Philipp Aust, *Freie Universität Berlin, Germany*, Giulio Bartolini, *Università degli studi Roma Tre, Italy*, Veronika Fikfak, *University College London, UK*, Monica Hakimi, *Columbia University, USA*

This flagship series is a forum for authored monographs that analyse current thinking and research across the spectrum of international law, rigorously examining key concepts as well as provoking debate and questions for further research.

Seeking to attract original thinking and new, challenging research, proposals are encouraged that engage with new and previously under-developed themes in the literature, or alternatively offer an innovative analysis of areas of uncertainty in the existing law.

Some books offer a strictly legal analysis of international law, whilst others weave together related fields of law, and some draw on insights from disciplines other than law, such as politics, economics or international relations. Bringing together work from both established authors and a new generation of scholars, what all books in the series have in common is that they represent a calibre of scholarship that makes significant contributions to our understanding of the field.

For a full list of Edward Elgar published titles, including the titles in this series, visit our website at www.e-elgar.com.

Sufficient Gravity before the International Criminal Court

Marco Longobardo

*Reader in International Law, Westminster Law School,
University of Westminster, UK*

ELGAR INTERNATIONAL LAW



Edward Elgar
PUBLISHING

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

© Marco Longobardo 2026

Every effort has been made to trace all the copyright holders but if any have been inadvertently overlooked please notify the publisher.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher. Without limiting the author's and publisher's exclusive rights, any unauthorised use of this publication to train generative artificial intelligence (AI) technologies is expressly prohibited.

Published by

Edward Elgar Publishing Limited
The Lypiatts
15 Lansdown Road
Cheltenham
Glos GL50 2JA
UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.
William Pratt House
9 Dewey Court
Northampton
Massachusetts 01060
USA

Authorised representative in the EU for GPSR queries only: Easy Access System Europe – Mustamäe tee 50, 10621 Tallinn, Estonia, gpsr.requests@easproject.com

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Control Number: 2026931912

This book is available electronically in the **Elgaronline**
Law subject collection
<https://doi.org/10.4337/9781802209969>

ISBN 978 1 80220 995 2 (cased)
ISBN 978 1 80220 996 9 (eBook)
ISBN 978 1 0494 0521 6 (ePub)

*Ai miei genitori, Cinzia e Nicola, come sempre.
Alla memoria di Katia Petrone,
la cui risata e i cui consigli sono sempre con me.
A Lucas, che ha cambiato tutto.*

Property of Edward Elgar Publishing Ltd. Unauthorised copying or distribution is prohibited.

Property of Edward Elgar Publishing Ltd. Unauthorised copying or distribution is prohibited.

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>		xi
William Schabas		
<i>Acknowledgements</i>		xiv
<i>List of abbreviations</i>		xvi
1	General introduction to the assessment of sufficient gravity	1
1.	Introduction	1
2.	The aim of this book and its contribution to knowledge	6
3.	The main argument, approach, and scope of this book	12
2	The theoretical approach to the assessment of sufficient gravity	14
1.	Introduction	14
2.	A jurisprudential examination of the perspectives from which sufficient gravity can be assessed	15
2.1	Sufficient Gravity: A Combined Evaluative Conceptual Term That Provides a Standard	15
2.2	The Assessment of Sufficient Gravity as a Problem of Legal Interpretation	18
2.3	Sufficient Gravity as an Inherently Subjective Notion That Can Only Be Assessed Subjectively	22
2.4	Sufficient Gravity as a Political – Rather Than Legal – Question	25
2.5	Sufficient Gravity as a Problem Pertaining to the Application Rather Than the Interpretation of Article 17(1)(d)	29
2.6	Preliminary Conclusions	31
3.	Rules on treaty interpretation and sufficient gravity	31
3.1	The Rules on Treaty Interpretation Provided by the RS	32
3.2	The Application of the Rules on Treaty Interpretation in the VCLT to Article 17(1)(d)	35
3.3	The Constitutive Nature of the RS and Interpretive Practice of its Organs	44
4.	Conclusions	50

3	The role of gravity in the Rome Statute: Article 17(1)(d) and beyond	52
1.	Introduction	52
2.	Preliminary remarks on gravity in international law	53
3.	Gravity and the emergence of international criminal law	58
4.	The many roles of gravity in the RS	64
4.1	Gravity and the Criminalisation of Certain Conduct	64
4.2	The Focus of This Book: Article 17(1)(d)	70
4.3	Gravity of the Crime as a Consideration in Assessing the Interests of Justice	87
4.4	Gravity and the Granting of Interim Release to Individuals Arrested by National Authorities	92
4.5	Gravity and the Determination of Penalties	93
4.6	Gravity and the Activity of the Court	96
5.	Conclusions	98
4	Determining the factors affecting gravity through the practice of the OTP and the Chambers	100
1.	Introduction	100
2.	The first attempts to assess sufficient gravity: from quantitative considerations to threefold approaches (2003–2006)	101
2.1	The Initial Practice of the OTP	101
2.2	The Initial Practice of the Chambers	104
3.	The four main gravity factors: scale, nature, manner of commission, and impact	114
3.1	The Early Formulation in the OTP's Appeal against PTC I's Gravity Assessment in the Lubanga and Ntaganda Arrest Warrants	115
3.2	The Four Factors in the OTP's Policy Papers and Regulations	116
3.3	The Convergence of the OTP and the Chambers on the Four Factors	118
3.4	The Evolution of the Four Factors	124
3.5	Critical Considerations on the Four Factors and Preliminary Conclusions	149
4.	The most responsible criterion	151
4.1	The Apparent Convergence of the OTP and Chambers on the Criterion	151
4.2	The Content of the Most Responsible Criterion	153
4.3	Why the Most Responsible Criterion Does Not Belong to Sufficient Gravity	158

5.	Conclusions	163
5	Article 17(1)(d) and sufficient gravity as a threshold	165
1.	Introduction	165
2.	Article 17(1)(d) as a minimal threshold	166
2.1	Sufficient Gravity as a Threshold	166
2.2	Treaty Interpretation and the Imperative of a Minimal Threshold	168
2.3	The Practice of the OTP and of the Chambers Regarding a Minimal Threshold	172
2.4	Different Assessments of the Minimal Gravity Threshold at Different Stages?	180
3.	Legal threshold versus relative guidance in the selection of situations and cases	187
3.1	The Ambiguous Approach of the OTP to Sufficient Gravity	187
3.2	The Academic Debate About 'Legal' or 'Absolute' Gravity versus 'Relative Gravity'	194
3.3	Against the Employment of Article 17(1)(d) to Compare and Select Situations and Cases	197
4.	The absence of gravity factors as an indication that a case is below the gravity threshold	207
5.	Conclusions	210
6	Judicial review of sufficient gravity	212
1.	Introduction	212
2.	Avenues for judicial review of the assessment of sufficient gravity pertaining to potential cases	213
2.1	No Judicial Review of Authorising a <i>Proprio Motu</i> Investigation under Article 15(4)	213
2.2	Potential Judicial Review under Article 18 upon Request of a State with Jurisdiction	217
2.3	Judicial Review of Decisions Not to Open an Investigation or Not to Launch Prosecution under Article 53(3)(a)	223
3.	Avenues for judicial review of the assessment of sufficient gravity pertaining to cases	238
3.1	No Judicial Review in Deciding on an Application for an Arrest Warrant under Article 58(1)	238
3.2	<i>Proprio Motu</i> Judicial Review under Article 19(1)	240
3.3	Judicial Review under Article 19(2)	245

x	<i>Sufficient gravity before the International Criminal Court</i>	
4.	Judicial review mechanisms applicable to both situations and cases	250
5.	Conclusions	252
7	General conclusions on the assessment of sufficient gravity	255
	<i>Selected Bibliography</i>	261
	<i>Index</i>	281

Property of Edward Elgar Publishing Ltd. Unauthorised copying or distribution is prohibited.