

Equality of Parties in International Adjudication

The Quest for a General Principle in Asymmetric
Proceedings

By

Caterina Milo



BRILL | NIJHOFF

Contents

Abbreviations XI

Table of Cases XIII

Introduction 1

1 The Fragmented Protection of Equality of Parties in International Law and International Adjudication 8

- 1 Introduction 8
- 2 The Definition and Theoretical Underpinnings of Equality of Parties 8
- 3 Equality of Parties in Domestic Proceedings Involving Private Entities as Provided by Human Rights Law 15
 - 3.1 Equal Access to Justice 17
 - 3.2 Equality of Arms 21
- 4 Equality of Parties between Public Entities in International Adjudication 25
 - 4.1 The Bases of (State) Party Equality: Sovereign Equality and Consent 26
 - 4.2 The Protection of Equality of Parties as Enshrined in the Rules of Procedure of Interstate Adjudication 31
 - 4.3 Equality of Parties in Disputes Involving International Organizations: Between Speciality and Equality 35
- 5 The Peculiar Case of Asymmetric Proceedings: What Happens When Both Private and Public Entities Partake in International Adjudication 44
- 6 Conclusions 51

2 The Different Models of Protection of Equal Access to International Asymmetric Adjudication 52

- 1 Introduction 52
- 2 Asymmetric Disputes and Investment Arbitration 54
 - 2.1 The Original Need to Offset States' Power against the Weaker Investors 55
 - 2.2 The New Asymmetry of ISDS: Investors' Almost Exclusive Power to Initiate Proceedings 57
 - 2.3 The Structural Incompatibility of Arbitration without Privity with Equality of Access 66

3	Asymmetric Proceedings before Permanent Courts and Tribunals	72
3.1	The Strategically Asymmetric Access to Regional Human Rights Courts	72
3.2	International Administrative Tribunals and the Asymmetries of Employment Relationships	85
4	Which Kind of Equality? The Impact of the Costs of Asymmetric Proceedings	94
5	Conclusions	99
3	Equality of Arms in the Procedural Rules and Practices of International Asymmetric Adjudication	101
1	Introduction	101
2	The Protection of Equality of Arms through Equal Allocation of Opportunities in Asymmetric Proceedings	102
3	The Protection of Equality of Arms through the Parties' Duty to Cooperate to Avoid Inequality	109
3.1	The Regime of <i>In Absentia</i> Proceedings	112
3.2	The Regime Concerning Evidence and the Failure to Disclose Relevant Documents	115
4	Equality of Arms as an "Overriding" Principle Shaping the Procedure of Asymmetric Adjudication	123
4.1	Unevenness Caused by a Procedural Mechanism: The Impact of Third-Party Participation on Equality of Arms	124
4.2	Unevenness Caused by the Differences in International Legal Personality of the Parties: The Role of Equality of Arms for the Composition of Courts and Tribunals	133
5	Equality of Arms as a Parameter for Evaluation of the Final Decisions of Asymmetric Courts and Tribunals	144
6	Conclusions	150
4	The Case for a General Principle as the Basis of Equality of Parties in International Asymmetric Proceedings	152
1	Introduction	152
2	Grounding the Protection of Equality of Parties in a Source of International Law	153
2.1	Treaty Law as a Source of International Procedural Law	159
2.2	Customary International Law as a Source of International Procedural Law	167

2.3	General Principles as a Source of International Procedural Law	171
3	Reasons for Anchoring the Protection of Equality of Parties to a General Principle of Law Derived from National Legal Systems	180
3.1	The Functions of a General Principle of Equality of Parties	182
3.2	The Domestic Origin of Equality of Parties for Asymmetric Disputes	193
4	The Diffusion of a General Principle of Equal Access to Justice and of Equality of Arms for Asymmetric Disputes in the Different Regions of the World	196
4.1	Equal Access	197
4.2	Equality of Arms	199
4.3	Equality of Parties in Administrative Adjudication	201
5	The Transposition of the General Principle of Equality of Parties in Asymmetric Disputes to the International Legal Order	205
5.1	Equality of Arms	207
5.2	Equal Access	209
6	Conclusions	214
	Conclusions	216
	Bibliography	223
	Index	249